COMMISSION FOR ENVIRONMENTAL COOPERATION OF NORTH AMERICA
Joint Public Advisory Committee Session No. 03-02

23–25 June 2003
Washington, DC

Summary Record

The Joint Public Advisory Committee (JPAC) of the Commission for Environmental Cooperation (CEC) of North America held a regular session on 23–25 June in Washington, DC, in conjunction with the Tenth Regular Session of the CEC Council and immediately following a Plenary Session on the CEC North American Environmental Enforcement Compliance Cooperation Program (EWG). A JPAC workshop on CEC Assessments of Transboundary Air Issues was also held jointly with the North American Air Working Group (NAAWG).

This Summary Record reports on each agenda item, records all decisions made by the Committee and identifies action items and responsibilities. (See Annex A for the agenda, Annex B for the list of participants, Annex C for a record of the Workshop on CEC Assessments of Transboundary Air Issues, Annex D for the record of the Plenary Session on the CEC North American Environmental Enforcement Compliance Cooperation Program, Annex E for a letter to the Chair of the EWG and Annex F for a letter to the Chair of the NAAWG).

Previous summary records, advice from JPAC to Council and other JPAC-related documents may be obtained from the JPAC Liaison Officer's office or through CEC's web site at <http://www.cec.org>.

Welcome and overview by the Chair

Gustavo Alanís-Ortega, the JPAC Chair, welcomed everyone to Washington, DC. He introduced Dan Christmas, the new member from Canada, then asked the JPAC members to introduce themselves to the participants. He explained that JPAC would be meeting in-camera with the Council and he encouraged the public provide comments on matters that could be brought to Council’s attention.

Approval of the agenda

The agenda was approved as prepared.

1 DISCLAIMER: Although this summary was prepared with care, readers should be advised that while JPAC members have approved it, it has not been reviewed nor approved by the intervenors and therefore may not accurately reflect their statements.
Report from the National and Governmental Advisory Committee Representatives

The Chair was pleased to announce that Mexico had recently reconstituted its National Advisory Committee (NAC). He then invited the representatives of the National and Governmental Advisory Committees (NACs and GACs) to make brief presentations.

The Chair of the US NAC explained that that committee had met in May to develop Advice to the US EPA Administrator in advance of the Council session. He also noted that the committee has eight new members out of 12, representing the private sector, the environmental community and academia. He reviewed the highlights of their advice:

- First, the US NAC strongly supports adoption of the Strategic Plan for North American Cooperation in the Conservation of Biodiversity, but notes that the CEC has limited resources and will need to find partners for implementation.
- Concerning a meeting of trade and environment ministers, the lack of an agenda and clear deliverables is being given by the Parties as the reasons for delay. The US NAC, therefore, has recommended a series of deliverables for such a meeting, including NAFTA Chapter 11, kicking off a North American corporate stewardship program, instructing the CEC Secretariat to add investment effects to its trade effects work and ensuring that NAFTA be updated to keep pace with new international trade agreements.
- The US NAC shares JPAC’s concerns on Articles 14 and 15 regarding recent decisions to focus on specific allegations and, particularly, noted problems of inefficiency, inherent conflict of interest, interference with the independence of the Secretariat and the tacit interpretation of provisions without going through the process adopted by Council Resolution 00-09. The US NAC is also very concerned with the lack of follow-up and recommended that the CEC follow up its factual records, noting that the CEC Enforcement Working Group could be a mechanism.
- The US NAC feels that the NACs and GACs should participate in the NAAEC ten-year review.

The Chair of the Canadian NAC expressed pleasure that the new Executive Director was now confirmed and he would be inviting him to their next meeting. He thanked the Acting Executive Director for his excellent work of the past year. He then explained that the committee continues to encourage other provinces in Canada to sign on to the NAAEC, noting that the ten-year review of NAFTA/NAAEC is a good opportunity to highlight the lack of participation. In the same context, he expressed hope that the ten-year review would spend some time evaluating public participation efforts and assessing successes and failures—trying to establish what has changed as a result of public participation efforts? He explained the importance of working more with local governments, where decisions are being made that effect people on a day-to-day basis. The Canadian NAC strongly urges a meeting between trade and environment ministers. He noted that the committee was developing an Advice on NAFTA Chapter 11. He thanked the CEC for its work on children’s health and the environment—citing progress on risk assessment and indicators—and he suggested that the initiative should become a cross-cutting program within the CEC. The NAC would like to see more a focused follow-up to the Secretariat’s Article 13 report on electricity and more work on global warming. Finally he encouraged JPAC to continue to push for improved public involvement within the CEC and in other venues such as the Free Trade of the Americas Agreement.
A member of the new Mexican NAC expressed optimism for the work of their new committee. The committee has representation from academia, NGOs, the private sector, and indigenous communities. They are preparing a web site as a tool for communication. He reported on work now underway with Profepa for reporting environmental information.

The Chair of the US GAC noted that the 10-year review of NAFTA/NAAEC was a priority for the committee. The committee is pleased that the CEC North American Air Working Group (NAAWG) is now operational, as they had been concerned with lack of progress. He suggested that the working group should focus on standards and involve all levels of government. He expressed support for the US NACs recommendation for work on corporate stewardship in the environment and trade program. Regarding Articles 14 and 15, the US GAC remains very concerned about the integrity and independence of the process and urged JPAC to remain vigilant. The US GAC is pleased with progress on children’s health and the environment and will continue to support this work.

**NAAEC Articles 14 and 15: Review of Council Resolution 00-09**

A member of the JPAC Working Group on Articles 14 and 15 reviewed its proposal for addressing the outstanding issues of: (a) limiting the scope of factual records, including what is evolving with recent decisions into interpreting what constitutes sufficient information to support an allegation of failure to enforce, and (b) the review of Council Resolution 00-09.

JPAC approved the proposal for a public review of these matters and would inform Council of this decision during the in-camera session. JPAC also decided that it would remind Council that by agreeing to work within the framework of Council Resolution 00-09 it has not ceded its authority under NAAEC Article 16(4) to provide advice on any matter within the scope of the NAAEC.

It was also agreed that a legal consultant be engaged to assist in preparing for the review by analyzing the four outstanding factual records once they are made public.

**Action: JPAC, Secretariat**

**Review of Council’s responses to JPAC Advice 02-12, 03-01 and 03-02**

Council replied to Advice 02-12: Re-energizing the Transboundary Environmental Impact Assessment Negotiations, stating: “In our view, the delicate trilateral negotiations would not be well served by the formation of a new negotiating group.”

It was agreed that this reply was simply not acceptable and that JPAC would raise the matter with Council in the in-camera session. If complexity were the issue, NAFTA would never have been signed. Progress is possible. The Chair reported that Mexico had recently submitted a proposal to the US and Canada to try and break the deadlock and JPAC would request details.

**Action: JPAC**

Regarding Advice to Council 03-1: Seeking Balance between the Interests of the Public and
Investors in the Application of Chapter 11 of the North American Free Trade Agreement and Advice to Council 03-02: Second North American Symposium on Assessing the Environmental Effects of Trade, the Chair reported that no replies had yet been received.

The members expressed extreme frustration at this lack of response and decided to relay JPAC’s concern that despite the huge public interest in these topics—as witnessed by the impressive level of discussion at the public meetings in March 2003 in Mexico City—there has been no follow up by Council. This is harming the credibility of the CEC. It was agreed that this message be delivered to Council during the in-camera session.

Action: JPAC

Discussion and approval of a potential Advice to Council on a long-term strategic plan for the CEC North American Environmental Enforcement and Compliance Cooperation Program

The Chair explained that the working group was proposing that the JPAC Chair send a letter to the Chair of the EWG with recommendations and observations stemming from the Plenary Session on 23 June. An Advice to Council would be premature, given that the EWG is soliciting input on the strategic plan.

A member of the working group reviewed the draft letter, which was shared on screen with the public. A long and substantive discussion followed and instructions for a new draft were given to the JPAC consultant. It was agreed that a new version would be circulated electronically after the meeting for final approval.

Action: JPAC Consultant, Secretariat, JPAC

Discussion and approval of a potential Advice to Council on CEC Assessments of Transboundary Air Issues

The Chair explained that the working group was proposing that the JPAC Chair send a letter to the Chair of the North American Air Working Group (NAAWG) with recommendations and observations stemming from the workshop on 24 June. An Advice to Council would seem premature, given that the NAAWG had had its first meeting only on 23 June and is just beginning to develop its work plan.

A member of the working group reviewed the draft letter, which was shared on screen with the public. A long and substantive discussion pursued and instructions for a new draft given to the JPAC consultant. It was agreed that a new version would be circulated electronically after the meeting for final approval.

Action: JPAC Consultant, Secretariat, JPAC

Follow-up of the Tenth Regular Session of the Council of the CEC

The Chair reported on the in-camera session with Council and explained that Council had made the following requests of JPAC:
• Continue to engage the public in the development of a strategic plan on the air-related issues relevant to North America, in cooperation with the NAAWG.
• Give input on work related to renewable energy throughout North America.
• Provide input on the management and tracking of hazardous waste in North America, in cooperation with the CEC Task Force on the Environmentally Sound Management and Tracking of Hazardous Wastes; and
• Be actively involved in the Ten-year Review of NAFTA/NAAEC.

**JPAC working groups: Member appointments and rotation**

Two new working groups were created.

Renewable Energy: Ann Bourget, Dinkerrai Desai, Laura Silvan
Hazardous Waste: Cam Avery, Arturo Duran, Carlos Sandoval

**Next JPAC Meetings**

The Chair reported that the next two meetings of JPAC would be:

2–3 October 2003, in Montreal, Quebec, Canada
A public round table on Articles 14 and 15 (public review of the scoping issue and review of Council Resolution 00-09)
Review of the 2004–2006 Proposed CEC Program Plan and Budget
Regular session of JPAC 03-03

4–5 December 2003, in Miami, Florida, USA
A public meeting on aquatic invasive species, in cooperation with the Conservation of Biodiversity Program
Regular session of JPAC 03-04

The first meeting in 2004 will be in January or February, in conjunction with a public meeting on the Secretariat’s Article 13 report on maize. It will take place in Mexico.

**Concluding comments from JPAC members**

A JPAC member noted that during the in-camera session it was clear that there was no consensus for a meeting with trade and environment ministers, with the US still hesitating. It was suggested and agreed that JPAC send a letter highlighting the dangers associated with not having such a meeting, i.e., lack of credibility and emerging hostility around trade agreements.

**Action: JPAC Chair**

Regarding future meetings, a discussion took place around the opportunities of linking with other international events to maximize JPAC’s exposure and public accessibility. It was also agreed that the idea of holding a meeting in an indigenous community be explored.

It was agreed that the Secretariat would prepare a communication plan for review and include continuing exchanges with the NACs and GACs

**Action: Secretariat, JPAC**
Observers’ comments

- JPAC and the CEC are woefully underfunded. There is not enough financial support for participants—only those who can afford to travel can come to the meetings.
- JPAC should be an advocate for the highest standards in pollution prevention. The capacity of human beings to deal with pollution does not change when they cross a border. New technologies, increased efficiency and alternative energy should be explored. (JPAC replied that it sees this area as very important and will continue to push it.)
- Having a meeting in an indigenous community is an excellent idea. Indigenous peoples have special environmental problems to deal with, such as intellectual property rights and inappropriate laws.
- The nuclear industry is re-emerging in the United States. This should be watched closely.

The Chair thanked the public, the members of JPAC, and its staff and voiced special appreciation for the work of the interpreters, then adjourned the session.

Prepared by Lorraine Brooke

APPROVED BY JPAC MEMBERS ON 18 JULY 2003
Commission for Environmental Cooperation (CEC) of North America

Tenth CEC Regular Session of the Council and Joint Public Advisory Committee (JPAC) Meetings

23-25 June 2003
Renaissance Mayflower Hotel
1127 Connecticut Avenue North West
Washington, D.C., USA
Phone: (202) 347-3000• Fax: (202) 776-9182
Toll Free: 1-800-228-7697

Preliminary Program of Public Events (as of 12 June 2003)

Sunday, 22 June 2003

18:00–20:00 Accreditation of participants

Monday, 23 June 2003

7:30–20:00 Accreditation of participants

8:30–17:30 Public Plenary Session on CEC North American Environmental Enforcement and Compliance Cooperation Program — Grand Ballroom (Promenade Level)

8:30–8:45 Opening remarks
   • Gustavo Alanís-Ortega, Chair of the Joint Public Advisory Committee
   • Jose Campillo, Attorney General for the Protection of the Environment, Profepa, and Chair of the EWG
   • Tim Whitehouse, Head of the CEC Law and Policy Program

8:45–9:30 Brief overview of country enforcement priorities
   • Phyllis Harris, Deputy Assistant Administrator, Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance, US EPA
   • Daniel Couture, Deputy Director of Enforcement Branch, Environmental Protection Service, Environment Canada
   • Gabriel Calvillo, Director of Federal Environmental Crimes and Litigation, Profepa

9:30–10:15 Question period

10:15–10:30 Break

10:30–11:30 Presentation of the North American Working Group on Environmental Enforcement and Compliance Cooperation (EWG)
   • General overview of the EWG, by Alejandra Goyenechea, Director for International Affairs, Profepa, and alt-Chair of the EWG
   • Presentation on the Illegal Traffic of Ozone-depleting Substances, by Bruce Pasfield, Assistant Chief, Environmental Crimes Section, Environment and Natural Resources Division, US Department of Justice
Preliminary Program of Public Events

- Presentation on Wildlife Enforcement, by Yvan Lafleur, Director of Wildlife Enforcement, Environment Canada, and Co-chair of the North American Wildlife Enforcement Group (NAWEG)
- Presentation on Environmental Management Systems, by Lorenzo Thomas, Director of Environmental Auditing, Profepa

11:30–12:30 Question period

12:30–14:00 Lunch (not provided)

Public Plenary Session on CEC North American Environmental Enforcement and Compliance Cooperation Program (cont’d) — Grand Ballroom (Promenade Level)

14:00–15:00 Long-term Strategic Plan for the CEC North American Environmental Enforcement and Compliance Cooperation Program
- Alejandra Goyenechea, Director for International Affairs, Profepa, and alt-Chair of the EWG
- Phyllis Harris, Deputy Assistant Administrator, Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance, US EPA
- Daniel Couture, Deputy Director of Enforcement Branch, Environmental Protection Service, Environment Canada
- Gabriel Calvillo, Director for Federal Environmental Crimes and Litigation, Profepa

15:00–17:30 Participants’ input
17:30 End of plenary session

17:30–18:00 Break

18:00–19:30 Welcoming Reception: Official Opening of the 10th Regular Session of the Council and launching of Itinerant Exhibit: Janos and the Grasslands of North America — State Room (Promenade Level)

Tuesday, 24 June 2003

8:00–17:00 Accreditation of participants

8:30–11:45 JPAC Workshop on CEC Assessments of Transboundary Air Issues — Grand Ballroom (Promenade Level)

8:30–8:35 Opening remarks by Gustavo Alanís-Ortega, Chair of the Joint Public Advisory Committee

8:35–9:20 Presentations of the CEC North American Air Working Group (NAAWG) Representatives

9:20–9:30 Overview of CEC Assessments of Transboundary Air Issues by Paul Miller, CEC Program Manager, Pollutants and Health

9:30–10:15 Public input on how to conduct a comparative study of air management systems across North America

10:15–11:00 Public input on how to conduct a survey to obtain information on the comparability of North American environmental standards for power plants

11:00–11:45 Public input on how to identify, explore and address issues related to how emissions trading systems might evolve in North America
Preliminary Program of Public Events

11:45–12:00 Break

12:00–13:15 Opening of JPAC Regular Session 03-02 ** Part I— Grand Ballroom (Promenade Level)
- Approval of the provisional agenda
- Report from the National and Governmental Advisory Committee representatives
- Review of Council Resolution 00-09: Matters related to the Articles 14 and 15
- Review Council’s responses: JPAC Advice 02-12, 03-01 and 03-02
- Observers’ comments

13:15–14:15 Lunch (not provided)

14:15–16:15 Public Portion of the Council Session — Grand Ballroom (Promenade Level)
- Opening of the Public Session
  - Welcoming Remarks by Christine Todd Whitman, Administrator US Environmental Protection Agency
  - Introduction on the conduct of the Session by Gustavo Alanís-Ortega, Chair of the Joint Public Advisory Committee
- Oral statements by pre-selected presenters grouped under the four CEC program and Specific Obligations under NAAEC, followed by comments from the three Council members:*  
  - Environment, Economy and Trade
  - Conservation of Biodiversity
  - Pollutants and Health
  - Law and Policy
  - Specific Obligations under NAAEC
- Closing remarks by Christine Todd Whitman, Administrator US Environmental Protection Agency

Wednesday, 25 June 2003

8:00–13:00 Accreditation of participants

9:00–12:30 JPAC Regular Session 03-02 ** Part II — Grand Ballroom (Promenade Level)
  9:00–10:30 Discussions and approvals of potential Advice to Council
  - Discussion and approval of a potential Advice to Council on Environmental Enforcement and Compliance Cooperation (EWG) and a long-term strategic plan for the working group
  - Discussion and approval of a potential Advice to Council on Emerging Air Quality Issues in North America
  10:30–11:00 Break

11:00–12:30 Follow-up and observers’ comments
  - Follow-up of the Tenth CEC Regular Session of the Council
  - JPAC working groups: Member appointments and rotation
  - Next JPAC meetings
  - Observers’ comments

12:30 End of the sessions

* See the registration form for details on the procedure for the selection of oral statements
** Session open to the public as observers
Liste des participants – Lista de participantes - List of Participants
(as of 4 July 2003)

Aguilar, Aida
Vice President
Sociedad Amigos del Lago Chapala
202 Avenida Madero
Chapala, Jalisco 45900
México
Tel: 52 376 765 5955
Fax: 52 376 765 5754
aida_aguilar@amigosdelago.org

Aguilar, Rodrigo
The American University
4400 Massachusetts Ave.
Congressional Hall Room 324
Washington, DC 20016
USA
Escuela_tec@yahoo.com.mx

Ahmed, A. Karim
Director, International Program
National Council for Science of the Environment
1707 H. Street, NW Suite 200
Washington, DC 20006
USA
Tel: 202 530 5810
Fax: 202 628 4311
ahmed@ncseonline.org

Allen, Linda
Doctoral Candidate
Indiana University
1315 E. Tenth St. Rm. 441
Bloomington, Indiana 47405
USA
linallen@indiana.edu

Arechar, Antonio
Student
The American University
Washington, DC
USA

Balderas Castillo, Javier
Director
Centro de DDHH
Tepeyar del Istmo de Tehuantepec
Priv. la Providencia #100
Barrio la Soledad
Tehuantepec, Oaxaca
México
Tel: 52 971 715 1442
Fax: 52 971 715 1442
cdhtepeyac@prodigy.net.mx

Bédard, Sylvain
Université de Montréal
2840 Pl. Darlington App 24
Montréal, Quebec H3S 1L5
Canada
sbed007@hotmail.com

Bienvenue, Claire
Intern
Organization of American States
1889 F St. Suite 623
Washington, DC 20006
USA
Fax: 202 458 3609
usdecpriz@oas.org

Brandt, Melissa
Intern
Center for International Environmental Law
1367 Connecticut Ave. NW Suite 300
Washington, DC 20009
USA
Tel: 202 581 1037
melissa_brandt@earthlink.net

Brooke, Lorraine
Consultant
3745 St-Jacques West, Suite 220
Montreal, Quebec H4C 1H3
Canada
Tel: 514 934 1218
Fax: 514 937 5114
lbrooke@ccemtl.org

Bushey, Sara
Policy Assistant to the Senior Director
National Wildlife Federation
1400 16th St. NW # 501
Washington, DC 20036
USA
Tel: 202 797 6661
Fax: 202 797 6646
bushey@nwf.org

Cameron, Rawle W.
President
The Environmental Performance Foundation of Canada
647 Ouellette Ave. Suite 204
Windsor, Ontario N9A 4J4
Canada
Tel: 519 256 7999
Fax: 519 256 2300
rcameron@epf-canada.org

Camou, Ximena
Student
3554 Appleton St. NW
Washington, DC 20008
USA
xcamou@qmri.com

Castellanos, Alma
Student
The American University
Center for North American Studies
Camino al Ajusco a San Pedro Martir #311
Col. Ejidos de San Pedro Martir
México, DF 14640
México
Tel: 52 555 573 4611
Fax: 52 555 661 5676
alma_castella@yahoo.com

Chabolla, Miguel
Sociedad Amigos del Lago Chapala
Avenida Madero 202
Chapala, Jalisco 45900
México
cdm45@hotmail.com

Chavarria, Gabriela
Policy Director
Wildlife Management
National Wildlife Federation
11100 Wildlife Center Drive
Reston, Virginia 20790-5362
USA
Tel: 703 438 6173
Fax: 703 438 6173
chavarria@nwf.org
Chen, Tina
Student
The American University
Center for North American Studies
3823 Porter Street, NW # 301
Washington, DC 20016
USA
Tel: 202 966 7177
leninlvr@hotmail.com

Christensen, Randy
Staff Lawyer
Sierra Legal Defence Fund
214 - 131 Water St.
Vancouver, British Columbia V6B 4M3 Canada
Tel: 604 685 5618
Fax: 604 685 7813
rchristensen@sierralegal.org

Cipres Villarreal, Alfonso
Presidente
Movimiento Ecologista Mexicano, A.C.
Calzada Guadalupe #120
Edif. 5 Depto. 004
Col. Ex Hacienda Coapa
México, DF 14300
México
Tel: 52 555 684 0562
Fax: 52 555 684 3241
memac@prodigy.net.mx

Contijoch, Manuel
Especialista en Recursos Hidraulicos
Banco Mundial
1818 H Street
Washington, DC 20433
USA
Fax: 202 473 3919
mcontijoch@worldbank.org

Dannenmaier, Eric
Director
Tulane University
Institute for Environmental Law & Policy
6329 Freret St.
New Orleans, Louisiana 70118
USA
Tel: 504 862 8829
Fax: 504 862 8857
edan@law.tulane.edu

De la Paz, Gabriela
Professor
ITESM
Eugenio Garza Sada 2501
Monterrey, Nuevo Léon
México
Tel: 52 818 358 4620
gdelapaz@itesm.mx

de Windt, Claudia
Project Attorney
Organization of American States
1889 F St. Suite 623
Washington, DC 20006
USA
Tel: 202 458 3560
Fax: 202 458 6914
cdewindt@oas.org

Demosthenis, Nikos
Student
The American University
Center for North American Studies
3231 Regina Ave.
Richmond, British Columbia V6X 2K6
Canada
Tel: 604 837 4697
nikosdemosthenis@hotmail.com

Dover, Sarah
Policy Advisor
Sierra Club of Canada
412 - 1 Nicholas St.
Ottawa, Ontario K1N 7B7
Canada
Tel: 416 537 3966
sdover@magma.ca

Dubay, Kristen
Intern
Carnegie Endowment for International Peace
1779 Massachusetts Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20036
USA
kdubay@carnegie.org

Eaton, David
American Society of Civil Engineer's
Environmental and Water Resource Institute
3702 Hidden Hollow
Austin, Texas 78732
USA
Tel: 512 471 8972
Fax: 512 471 1835
oneal@mail.utexas.edu

Elkins, Jake
Project Manager
Sustainable Borderlands Planning, Inc.
1309 E. Lee St.
Tucson, Arizona 85719
USA
Tel: 520 327 4058
borderlands@igc.org

Fascione, Nina
Vice-President
Species Conservation
1101 14th St. NW, Suite 1400
Washington, DC 20005
USA
Tel: 202 789 2844 x 105
nfascione@defenders.org

Fenge, Terry
Strategic Counsel
Inuit Circumpolar Conference
609 Dovercourt Ave.
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0V5
Canada
Tel: 613 722 7006
tfenge7006@rogers.com

Ferris, Raymond
Deputy Grand Chief
Nishnawbe - Aski Nation
Thundaer Bay, Ontario P7C 1C2
Canada
Tel: 807 623 8228
Fax: 807 623 7730
rferrris@nan.on.ca

Gómez Lora, Sergio
Consultant
IDB
1300 NY St. NW
Washington, DC 20004
USA

González, Angelica
Student
The American University
4400 Massachusetts Ave.
Washington, DC 20016
USA

Gray, Rhys
Graduate Student
The American University
3617, 38th Street NW App 208
Washington, DC 20016
USA
rhysgray@hotmail.com

Guerrer, María Teresa
Director
Comision de Solidaridad y Defensa de los Derechos Humanos, A.C.
Terrazas No. 2408, Col. Pacífico 31030
Chihuahua, Chihuahua
México
Tel: 52 614 410 7755
Fax: 52 614 415 0486
kwira@terra.com.mx

Gutiérrez, Roberto Carlos
Student
The American University
Room 307 Federal Hall, Tenley Campus
Washington, DC 20016
USA
rrcrc3@hotmail.com
Gutiérrez Nájera, Raquel  
Presidenta  
Instituto de Derecho Ambiental, A.C.  
Misión de San Felipe No. 13 Depto. 10  
Zapopan, Jalisco 45040  
México  
Tel: 52 333 620 5726  
Fax: 52 333 620 5726  
idea03@prodigy.net.mx

Hanley, Alan  
Legal Specialist  
Corporate Environmental Programs  
General Electric Company  
3135 Easton Turnpike  
Fairfield, Connecticut 06431  
USA  
Tel: 203 373 2932  
Fax: 203 373 2683  
Alan.Hanley@corporate.ge.com

Heskett, Erin  
Deputy Director  
International Fund for Animal Welfare  
411 Main Street  
Yarmouth Port, Massachusetts  
USA  
Tel: 508 744 2192  
Fax: 508 744 2089  
eheskett@ifaw.org

Hunter, David  
President  
Peregrine Environmental Consultant  
7509 Hancock Ave.  
Takoma Park, Maryland 20912  
USA  
hunter202@earthlink.net

Joffe, Paul  
Senior Director of International Affairs  
National Wildlife Federation  
1400 16th St. NW # 501  
Washington, DC 20036  
USA  
Tel: 202 797 6603  
Fax: 202 797 6646  
joffe@nwf.org

Juárez, Alma Lucia  
Student  
The American University  
Tenley Campus at American University  
Room 208 Federal Hall  
Washington, DC 20016  
USA  
Tel: 202 985 4508  
a09439a@american.edu

Kagy, Jean-Francois  
Université de Montréal  
186 George-Vanier  
Laval, Quebec H7G 1J3  
Canada  
sparrow_966@yahoo.com

Kaiser, Wike  
Student  
The American University  
3726 Connecticut Ave. NW Suite 216  
Washington, DC 20008  
USA  
wike_kaiser@hotmail.com

Kauachi, Luis  
Director of International Projects  
ITESM  
Fisicos 142 Col. Tecnologico  
Monterrey, Nuevo Léon  
México  
lkahuachi@itesm.mx

Kelly, Mary  
Attorney  
Environmental Defense  
44 East Ave. #30  
Austin, Texas 78701  
USA  
Tel: 512 479 0600  
Fax: 512 478 5161  
mkelly@ed.org

Killgore, Mark  
Principal Engineer  
American Society of Civil Engineer's  
Environmental and Water Resource Institute  
10824 158 Ct. NE  
Redmond, Washington 98052  
USA  
mkillgore@louisberger.com

La Chapelle, D.J.  
JM Kaplan Fund  
28 Sunset Dr.  
Alexandria, Virginia 22301  
USA

Lee, Alison  
Doctoral Candidate  
University of California, Riverside  
Dept. of Anthropology 1334  
Watkins HALL  
Riverside, California 92521  
USA  
Tel: 858 453 8638  
Fax: 909 757 5409  
alisonelee@aol.com

Limón Domínguez, Gerardo Arturo  
Presidente  
Movimiento Ecologista en Chihuahua  
Cortez de Monroy  
3102 Parques de San Felipe  
Chihuahua, Chihuahua 31240  
México  
Tel: 52 614 414 3631  
Fax: 52 614 414 4552  
galimon@prodigy.net.mx

List, Rurik  
Director  
Agrupación Dodo, A.C.  
Matamoros 14, Esq. M. Doblado  
Col. Pilares  
Metépec, Estado de México 52179  
México  
Tel: 52 555 622 9004  
Fax: 52 722 216 6146  
rlist@prodigy.net.mx

Lopes, Paula  
Ph.D. Candidate  
John Hopkins University  
Poli. Sci. Dept. 3400 N. Charles Street  
Baltimore, Maryland 21218  
USA

Mackenzie, Celeste  
Freelance Journalist for Eco Americas Magazine  
132 Flora St.  
Ottawa, Ontario K1R 5R5  
Canada  
Tel: 416 231 8427  
Fax: 416 262 3361  
mackceleste@aol.com

Malchow, Pat  
Researcher  
Sustainable Borderlands Planning, Inc.  
1309 E. Lee St.  
Tucson, Arizona 85719  
USA  
Tel: 520 327 4058  
borderlands@igc.org

Manuel, Arthur  
Spokesperson  
Indigenous Network on Economies & Trade  
207 West Hastings, Suite 714  
Vancouver, British Columbia  
Canada  
Tel: 250 319 0688  
Fax: 250 679 3403  
artmanuel@earthlink.net
Margolis, Michael  
Fellow  
Resources for the Future  
1616 P St. NW  
Washington, DC 20036  
USA  
Tel: 202 328 5127

Martínez, José María  
Profesor  
Universidad de Sonora  
Bld. Encinas y Rosales  
Hermosillo, Sonora 83100  
México  
Tel: 52 662 259 2252  
josemaria@industrial.uson.mx

Medina, Xavier  
Graduate Student  
The American University  
Center for North American Studies  
801 Locust Pl. NE # 2037E  
Albuquerque, New Mexico 87102  
USA  
Tel: 505 710 6187  
djmedina@umn.edu

Meza, Liliana  
The American University  
3201 New Mexico Ave. Suite 265  
Washington, DC 20016  
USA

Mizroch, John  
President  
World Environment Center  
419 Park Ave. South #500  
New York, New York 10016  
USA  
Tel: 212 683 4700  
john@wec.org

Morales, Isidro  
Professor  
Universidad de las Americas  
Santa Catarina Martir  
Puebla, Puebla 72820  
México  
Tel: 52 222 229 2051  
Fax: 52 222 229 2635  
imorales@mail.udlap.mx

Moyer, Dianna  
Student  
The American University  
3850 Tunlaw Road NW #703  
Washington, DC 20007  
USA  
diannamoyer@starpower.net

Muñoz Torres, Javier  
Asistente de Investigacion  
Centro de Investigacion y Docencia Economicas  
Cda. Colorines Mz. 10-A Lt. 66  
Col. Forestal  
México, DF 07140  
México  
Tel: 52 555 727 9800  
Javier.Munoz@cide.edu

Nauman, Talli  
Editor  
Interhemispheric Resource Center  
Novillo 510 Fracc. Ojocaliente  
Aguascalientes, Aguascalientes  
México  
Tel: 52 449 974 1593  
Fax: 52 449 974 1593  
Jaguar@ infosel.net.mx

Nugent, Conn  
Executive Director  
The J.M. Kaplan Fund  
261 Madison Ave. 19th Street  
New York, New York 10016  
USA  
Tel: 212 767 0630  
Fax: 212 767 0639  
cnugent@jmkfund.org

Olmos, Ruben  
Graduate Student  
The American University  
2725, 39th Street NW Apt. 405  
Washington, DC 20007  
USA  
rolnos@hotmail.com

Ortiz, Maria  
OAS  
19th St.  
Washington, D.C.  
USA  
Tel: 202 458 3695  
mortiz@hotmail.com

Perrault, Anne  
Attorney  
CIEL  
1367 Connecticut Ave. NW  
Washington, DC 20036  
USA  
Tel: 202 785 8700  
aperrault@ciel.org

Petelle, Jennifer  
Graduate Student  
The American University  
1703 East-West Hwy. #119  
Silver Spring, Maryland 20910  
USA  
jenpetelle@yahoo.com

Petz, Barbara  
Professor  
The American University  
2201 Wilson Blvd. App 421  
Arlington, Virginia 22201  
USA  
bpetz@itesm.mx

Rabben, Linda  
Senior Washington Representative  
HREP Sierra Club  
408 C St. NE  
Washington, DC 20002  
USA  
Tel: 202 675 7907  
linda.rabben@sierraclub.org

Ramos Martínez, Roberto  
The American University  
4400 Massachusetts Ave.  
Washington, DC 20016  
USA

Ranger, Cindy  
The American University  
4400 Massachusetts Ave. Federal Hall 208  
Washington, DC 20016  
USA

Rien, Patrick  
Graduate Student  
The American University  
5325 Westbard Ave. #1022  
Bethesda, Maryland 20816  
USA  
patrick.riens@american.edu

Rincón Valdes, Carlos Armando  
Director de Proyectos México-Estados Unidos  
Environmental Defense  
1100 N. Stanton, Suite 805  
El Paso, Texas 79902  
USA  
Tel: 915 543 9292  
Fax: 915 543 9115

Rishell, Susan  
PhD Student  
2629 E. Madison  
Springfield, Missouri 6903  
USA  
Tel: 417 865 7157  
Fax: 417 866 8743  
susanrishell@yahoo.com
Rodríguez, José
Intern
The American University
4400 Massachusetts Ave. NW
Room 323 Congressional Hall
Washington, DC 20016
USA
Tel: 202 895 4608
jr7469a@american.edu

Rodríguez, Dora
Directora - Washington Office
ITESM
1889 F St. NW
Washington, DC 20006
USA
Tel: 703 351 0090
Fax: 202 458 3072
drodriguez@iacd.oas.org

Ruiz-Luna, Arturo
Centro de Investigación en Alimentación y Desarrollo (CIAD) Unidad Mazatlan
Sabalo-Cerritos s/n
Mazatlan, Sinaloa 82000
México
Tel: 52 669 988 0158
Fax: 52 669 988 0159
arluna@victoria.ciad.mx

Sandoval, Carlos
Student
The American University
440 Massachusetts Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20016-8108
USA
Tel: 202 895 4585
carlos_sr@hotmail.com

Schabus, Nicole
PhD Student
INET
#714 – 207 Mestings
Vancouver, British Columbia V6B 1M7
Canada
Tel: 604 785 5806
Fax: 604 608 0244
nicole@iiisd.org

Scherr, S. Jacob
Director, International Program
Natural Resources Defense Council
1200 New York Ave., NW Suite 400
Washington, DC 20005
USA
Tel: 202 289 6868
Fax: 202 289 1060
jscherr@nrdc.org

Simpson, Amelia
Director Environmental Justice Campaign
Environmental Health Coalition
1717 Kettner Blvd Suite 100
San Diego, California 92101
USA
Tel: 619 235 0281
Fax: 619 232 3670
amelias@environmentalhealth.org

Sirvent, Carlos
Student
The American University
1401 N. Taft St. APT 918
Arlington, Virginia 22201
USA
Tel: 703 812 9431
sirventcarlos@hotmail.com

Stauffer, Steven
Student
The American University
440 Massachusetts Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20016
USA
Tel: 202 895 4646
Ss4702a@american.edu

Stemper, David
Associate Director
Center for North American Studies
The American University
3201 New Mexico Ave. NW #265
Washington, DC 20016
USA
Tel: 202 885 1525
Fax: 202 885 1366
stemper@american.edu

Toommaly, Bouapha
Trade Program Coordinator
Rural Coalition
1411 K St. NW Suite 901
Washington, DC 20005
USA
Tel: 202 628 7160
Fax: 202 628 7165
bouapha@ruralco.org

Torres, Miguel Angel
Co-Director
Periodismo para Elevar la Conciencia Ecológica
Rancho Viejo 137
Aguascalientes, Aguascalientes
México
Tel: 52 449 974 1593
Fax: 52 449 974 1593
Balam56@yahoo.com

Trevisio, Cesar
M.Sc. Eng.
Green Building Challenge - Mexico
Mississippi # 347 - A Ote, Col. del Valle Garza García, Nuevo León 00220
México
Tel: 52 818 040 8080
Fax: 52 818 040 8081
utrevino@avantel.net

Turnil, Juan Miguel
Coordinator
Little Village Environmental Justice Organization
2856 South Milland Ave.
Chicago, Illinois 60623-4550
USA
Tel: 773 762 6991
Fax: 773 762 6993
lvejo@igc.org

Ulmber, Vanessa
Junior Fellow
Carnegie Endowment for International Peace
1779 Massachusetts Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20036
USA
Tel: 202 939 2378
vulmer@ceip.org

Van Dyke, Brennan
Regional Director
United Nations Environment Program
1707 H St. NW Suite 300
Washington, DC 20006
USA
Tel: 202 785 0465
Fax: 202 785 2096
so@rona.unep.org
Van Putten, Mark  
President and CEO  
National Wildlife Federation  
11100 Wildlife Center Drive  
Reston, Virginia 20790-5362  
USA  
Tel: 703 438 6450  
Fax: 703 438 6450  
mvp@nwf.org

Vera, Esdras  
Intern  
The American University  
3201 New Mexico Ave. NW #265  
Washington, DC 20016  
USA  
Tel: 787 525 6491  
ev7471a@american.edu

Vera, Claudia del Carmen  
Abogada  
Centro de DDHH  
Tepeyar del Istmo de Tehuantepec  
Priv. la Providencia #100  
Barrio la Soledad  
Tehuantepec, Oaxaca  
México  
Tel: 52 971 715 1442  
Fax: 52 971 715 1442  
cdhtepayan@prodigy.net.mx

Von Bijlow, Marisa  
Ph.D. Candidate  
John Hopkins University  
Poli. Sci. Dept. 3400 N. Charles Street  
Baltimore, Maryland 21218  
USA  
bulow@starpower.net

Wallis, Cliff  
President  
Alberta Wilderness Association  
615 Deercroft Way SE  
Calgary, Alberta T2J 5V4  
Canada  
Tel: 403 271 1408  
Fax: 403 271 1408  
deercroft@shaw.ca

Wells, Richard  
President  
The Lexington Group  
110 Hartwell Ave.  
Lexington, Maryland 02421  
USA  
Tel: 781 674 7302  
Fax: 781 674 2851  
richard.wells@lexgrp.com

Wiggins, Armstrong A.  
Director Latin America  
Indian Law Resource Center  
601 E. St. SE  
Washington, DC 20003  
USA

Wilson, Serena  
1747 Pennsylvania Ave. NW, Suite 1200  
Washington, DC 20006  
USA  
Tel: 703 759 4642  
Fax: 703 759 9897

Woods, Eric  
The American University  
4400 Massachusetts Ave.  
Washington, DC 20016  
USA  
Tel: 202 895 4685  
Erw501@mail.usask.ca

Zaval, José  
Director Ambiental  
Informa, A.C.  
Alivio Norte 28C Ciudad Industrial Otay  
Tijuana, Baja California 22500  
México  
Tel: 52 664 623 3339  
Fax: 52 664 623 3280  
jczavala@telnor.net

Zavala Villalobos, Ana Cecilia  
The American University  
Congressional Hall  
Tenley Campus Room 322  
Washington, DC 20016  
USA  
Tel: 202 661 8097  
Az1918a@american.edu
Canadian Delegation — 10TH Regular Session of the Council, 2003

Anderson, David
Minister of the Environment
Environment Canada
10 Wellington Street
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 997 1441
Fax: 819 997 2742

Arseneau, John
Director General
Environment Canada
351 St. Joseph Blvd.
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 953 1114
Fax: 819 953 5371
john.arseneau@ec.gc.ca

Barton, Jane
Chief
International SMOG Program
Environment Canada
351 St. Joseph Blvd.
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 994 3655
Fax: 819 953 8963
Jane.barton@ec.gc.ca

Bordas, Agusti
Policy Advisor
Environment Canada
10 Wellington Street, 23rd Floor
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 956 5947
Fax: 819 997 0199
Agusti.bordas@ec.gc.ca

Cerutti, Rita
Manager, NAAEC
Environment Canada
10 Wellington Street, 23rd Floor
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 994 0148
Fax: 819 997 0199
Rita.Cerutti@ec.gc.ca

Estrin, Kayla
Manager, Canada/US relations
Environment Canada
Americas Branch, IRD
10 Wellington, 23rd floor
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada

Ferguson, Kimberley
Legal Officer
Department of Foreign Affairs and
International Trade
125 Sussex Drive
Ottawa, Ontario
K1A 0G2
Canada
Tel: 613 992 1990
Fax: 613 992 6483
Kimberley.ferguson@dfait-maeci.gc.ca

Graham, Kathy
Policy Advisor
Environment Canada
10 Wellington Street
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 953 7892
Fax: 819 997 0199
kathy.graham@ec.gc.ca

Hamilton, Heather
Manager
Environment Canada
4999-98th Avenue, Room 200
Edmonton, Alberta T6B 2X3
Canada
Tel: 780 951 8867
Fax: 780 495 2478

Hanak, Daryl
International Trade Counsel
Government of Alberta
12th Floor, Commerce Place
Edmonton, Alberta
Canada
Tel: 780 422 1339
Fax: 780 427 0699
daryl.hanak@gov.ab.ca

Hodges, Tim
Canadian Embassy
501 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20001
USA
Tel: 202 682 7741
Fax: 202 682 7795
Tim.hodges@dfait-maeci.gc.ca

Ladouceur, Nicole
Director General
International Relations Branch
Environment Canada
10 Wellington Street
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 994 4404
Fax: 819 997 6227
nicole.ladouceur@ec.gc.ca

Lapiere, Louise
Conseillère
Ministère de l'environnement
Direction des Affaires Intergouvernementales
675 boul. René-Levesque Est, 6e étage
Québec, Québec G1R 5V7
Canada
Tel: 418 651 6107
Fax: 418 521 3828 x 4105
Louise.lapiere@menv.gouv.qc.ca

Mackay-Alie, Jenna
Director Americas Branch
Environment Canada
10 Wellington Street
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 994 1670
Fax: 819 997 0199
Jenna.Mackay-Alie@ec.gc.ca

Owen, Gordon
Director General
Air Pollution Prevention
Environment Canada
351 St. Joseph Blvd. 10th Floor
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 997 1298
Fax: 819 953 9547
Gord.owen@ec.gc.ca

Revil, Emilie
Policy Officer
Department of Foreign Affairs and
International Trade, Canada
125 Sussex Drive
Ottawa, Ontario K1A 0G2
Canada
Tel: 613 996 1927
Fax: 613 995 9525
emilie.revil@dfait-maeci.gc.ca

Schwartz, Sandra
Policy Advisor
Environment Canada
10 Wellington Street, 28th Floor
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 997 1441
Fax: 819 997 2742
sandra.schwartz@ec.gc.ca
Smith, Norine
Assistant Deputy Minister
Environment Canada
10 Wellington Street
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 994 4882
Fax: 819 997 5981
norine.smith@ec.gc.ca

Stemshorn, Barry
Assistant Deputy Minister
Environmental Protection Services
Environment Canada
351 St. Joseph Blvd.
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 997 1575
Fax: 819 953 9452
Barry.stemshorn@ec.gc.ca

Waddell, Jonathan
Policy Advisor
Office of the Minister
Environment Canada
10 Wellington St., 28th Floor
Gatineau, Quebec K1A 0H3
Canada
Tel: 819 997 1441
Fax: 819 997 7242
jonathan.waddell@ec.gc.ca
Mexican Delegation — 10th Regular Session of the Council, 2003

Eden Winter, Rocío Alatorre
Directora Ejecutiva
Exposición a Factores de Riesgos
Comisión Federal de Protección Contra Riesgos Sanitarios
Secretaría de Salud
Monterrey No. 33
México, DF 06700
México
Tel: 52 555 514 8573
rocioal@salud.gob.mx

Arriag, Raúl
Subsecretario de Gestión para la Protección Ambiental
SEMARNAT
Blvd. Adolfo Ruiz Cortines No. 4209
México, DF 04209
México
Tel: 52 555 628 0623
Fax: 52 555 625 6999
rarriaga@semarnat.gob.mx

Cabrera, Javier
Administrador Conjunto
COCEF
Blvd. Tomás Fernández #8069
Ciudad Juarez, Chihuahua 32470
México
Tel: 52 656 688 4623
Fax: 52 656 625 6999
jcabrera@cocef.org

Calvillo, Gabriel
Director General de delitos Federales PROFEPa
Camino al Ahusco #200
Col. Jardines en la Montaña
México, DF 14210
México
Tel: 52 555 631 74 60
Fax: 52 555 615 2085
gcalvillo@correo.profepa.gob.mx

Campillo, José
Procurador PROFEPa
Camino al Ahusco #200
Col. Jardines en la Montaña
México, DF 14210
México
Tel: 52 555 494 6300
Fax: 52 555 440 2689
procurador@correo.profepa.gob.mx

De María y Campos, Alfonso
México, DF
México

García Velasco, Mauricio
Director General Adjunto de Asuntos Jurídicos y Multilaterales SEMARNAT
Avenida San Jerónimo, No. 458
Col. Jardines del Pedregal
México, DF 01900
México
Tel: 52 555 490 2157
Fax: 52 555 490 2194
mgarcia@semarnat.gob.mx

Gutiérrez, Fernando
Director General
Instituto para la Protección Ambiental de la Cámara de la Industria de la Transformación de Nuevo León CAINTRA
Av. Parque Fundidora No. 501
Monterrey, Nuevo León 64010
México
Tel: 52 818 569 0252
Fax: 52 818 369 0254
fgutierrez@caintra.com

Hernández, Miguel Angel
Attaché del Secretario
SEMARNAT
Blvd. Adolfo Ruiz Cortines No. 4209
México, DF 04209
México

Lendo, Enrique
Director General Cooperación Económica SEMARNAT
Avenida San Jerónimo 450
Col. Jardines del Pedregal
México, DF 4620
México
Tel: 52 555 490 2124
Fax: 52 555 490 2194
alendo@semarnat.gob.mx

Lichtinger, Victor
Secretario de Medio Ambiente y Recursos Naturales SEMARNAT
Blvd. Adolfo Ruiz Cortines No. 4209
México, DF 04209
México
Tel: 52 555 628 0602
Fax: 52 555 628 0644
vlichtinger@semarnat.gob.mx

Martínez Ocegueda, Arnaldo
Titular
Unidad Coordinadora de Comunicación Social SEMARNAT
Blvd. Adolfo Ruiz Cortines No. 4209
México, DF 04209
México
Tel: 52 555 628 0891
Fax: 52 555 628 0778
aocegueda@semarnat.gob.mx

Maus, Teodoro
Director
Representación de la SEMARNAT en Washington Embassy of Mexico
1911 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20006 USA
Tel: 202 728 1770
Fax: 202 728 1781
Teodoro.maus@semarnat.gob.mx

Montaño, Fernanda
Segunda Secretaria
Representación de la SEMARNAT en Washington Embassy of Mexico
1911 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20006 USA
Tel: 202 728 1770
Fax: 202 728 1781

Núñez Birrueta, Israel
Director General Adjunto de Cooperación Internacional SEMARNAT
Avenida San Jerónimo 458, piso 3
Col. Jardines del Pedregal
México, DF 01900
México
Tel: 52 555 490 2118
Fax: 52 555 490 2194
inunez@semarnat.gob.mx

Ojeda, Olga
Titular
Unidad Coordinadora de Asuntos Internacionales UCAI SEMARNAT
Ave. San Jerónimo, No. 458
Col. Jardines del Pedregal
México, DF 01900
México
Tel: 52 555 490 2116
Fax: 52 555 490 2194
olojeda@semarnat.gob.mx
Mexican Delegation — 10\textsuperscript{th} Regular Session of the Council, 2003

\textbf{Pined, Patricia}  
Gerente Ejecutiva  
Vinculación con Organismos Internacionales  
Comisión Federal de Protección Contra Riesgos Sanitarios  
Secretaría de Salud  
Monterrey No. 33  
México, DF 06700  
México  
Tel: 52 555 511 1033  
ppineda@salud.gob.mx

\textbf{Román Moguel, Guillermo}  
Director General  
Manejo Integral de Contaminantes  
SEMARNAT  
Av. Revolución No. 1425  
México, DF 01040  
México  
Tel: 52 555 624 3390  
Fax: 52 555 624 3690  
groman@semarnat.gob.mx

\textbf{Sánchez Martínez, Sergio}  
Director General  
Gestión de Calidad del Aire y RETC  
SEMARNAT  
Av. Revolución 1425 Nivel 39  
Col. Tlacopac San Angel  
México, DF 01040  
México  
Tel: 52 555 624 3500  
Fax: 52 555 624 3596  
sesanchez@semarnat.gob.mx
Adkins, Jocelyn
Office of General Counsel
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 5424
adkins.jocelyn@epa.gov

Jose, Aguto
Office of International Affairs
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 0289
aguto.jose@epa.gov

Ayres, Judith E.
Assistant Administrator
Office of International Affairs
U.S. EPA
401 M Street, S. W.
Mail Code 2610R
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 6600
ayres.judithe@epa.gov

Bowman, Peter
Economist
Dept. of Commerce
1401 Constitution Avenue
Washington, DC 20230
USA
Fax: 202 482 5865
Peter_Bowman@ita.doc.gov

Breen, Barry
Office of Solid Waste and Emergency Response
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Burnham, Jeff
Deputy Assistant Secretary
OES - Dept. of State
Washington, DC
USA

Clifford, Jerry M.
Deputy Assistant Administrator
Office of International Affairs
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 6600

Cough, Paul
Director
Office of International Environmental Policy
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 6459
cough.paul@epa.gov

Cruden, John
Deputy Assistant Attorney General
U.S. Dept. of Justice
950 Pennsylvania Ave. NW Room 2141
Washington, DC 20530
USA
Tel: 202 514 2718
Fax: 202 514 0557
John.cruden@usdoj.gov

Fisher, Linda
Deputy Administrator
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 711
fisher.linda@epa.gov

Frigerio, Lorry
CEC Coordinator
Office of International Affairs - U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 6407
frigerio.lorry@epa.gov

Grumbles, Ben
Deputy Assistant Administrator
Office of Water
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Harris, Phyllis
Deputy Assistant Administrator
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 2450
Fax: 202 501 3842
harris.phyllis@epa.gov

Hill-Macon, Cam
Office of International Affairs
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 6408
hill-macon.cam@epa.gov

Holmstead, Jeffrey
Assistant Administrator
Office of Air and Radiation
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 7400
holmstead.jeff@epa.gov

Jones, Marshall
Deputy Director
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service
1849 C Street, N.W., Room 3256
Washington, DC 20240
USA
Tel: 202 208 4545
Fax: 202 208 6965
marshall_jones@fws.gov

Lent, Rebecca
Deputy Assistant Administrator for Regulatory Programs
Department of Commerce NOAA/NMFS
1315 East-West Highway
14th Floor
Silver Spring
Maryland  20910-3283
USA
rebecca.lent@noaa.gov

Linscott, Mark
Acting Assistant US Trade Representative
Environment and Natural Resources
USA

Marzouk, Evonne
Office of International Affairs
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 7529
marzouk.evonne@epa.gov

Mehan, Tracy
Assistant Administrator
Office of Water
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 5700

Polisar, John
Biodiversity Specialist
OES/ENV
U.S. Dept. of State
USA

Redlin, David
Office of International Affairs
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 6437
redlin.david@epa.gov

Rodman, Joanne
Acting Director
Office of Children’s Environmental Health
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 2708
rodman.joanne@epa.gov

Rose, Erwin
North American Affairs Officer
Office of Environmental Policy
Dept. of State
2201 C Street, NW
Washington, DC 20520
USA
Tel: 202 647 4284
Fax: 202 647 1052
roseed@state.gov

Sanders, William
Deputy Assistant Administrator
Office of Prevention
Pesticides and Toxic Substances
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 0554
sanders.william@epa.gov

Schabacker, Chris
Counselor to the Assistant Secretary for Water
U.S. Department of the Interior
Washington, DC
USA

Shigetomi, Kent
Director for Mexico and NAFTA
Office of the U.S. Trade Representative
600 17th Street, NW
Washington, DC 20508
USA
Tel: 202 395 9459
Fax: 202 395 9517
kshigetomi@ustr.gov

Todd Whitman, Christine
Administrator
U.S. EPA
401 M Street, S. W. Mail Code 2660R
Washington, DC 20004
USA

Wheeler, Douglas
Hogan & Harston
Washington, DC
USA
CANADA

Avery, Cam
Director of Public Affairs
Terasen Inc.
1111 West Georgia Street
Vancouver, BC
V6E 4M4
Tel: 604 443 6603
Fax: 604 443 6530
cam.avery@terasen.com

Bourget, Ann
Hôtel de ville de Québec
2, rue des Jardins
C.P. 700, Haute-Ville
Québec, Québec G1R 4S9
Tel: 418 641 6411 Ext. 1076
Fax: 418 641 6465
ann.bourget@ville.quebec.qc.ca

Christmas, Daniel
Senior Advisor
Membertou Band Council
Membertou Office 111, Membertou Street
Membertou, Nova Scotia B1S 2M9
Canada
Tel: 902 564 6466 x 228
Fax: 902 539 6645
dan.christmas@membertou.ca

Phare, Merrell-Ann
Executive Director / Legal Counsel
Centre for Indigenous Environmental Resources
3rd Floor, 245 McDermot Ave.
Winnipeg, Manitoba R3B 0S6
Canada
Tel: 204 956 0660
Fax: 204 956 1895
maphare@cier.ca

Tingley, Donna
Executive Director
Clean Air Strategic Alliance
10035, 108 Street NW, Floor 10
Edmonton, Alberta T5J 3E1
Canada
Tel: 780 427 9793
Fax: 780 422 3127
dtingley@casahome.org

MEXICO

Alanís-Ortega, Gustavo
Presidente
Centro Mexicano de Derecho Ambiental
Alixco No. 138
Col. Condesa - Atl ixco
México, DF 06140
México
Tel: 52 555 286 3323
Fax: 52 55 211 2593
galanis@cemda.org.mx
JPAC Chair for 2003

Bastida-Muñoz, Mindahi Crescencio
Presidente
Consejo Mexicano para el Desarrollo Sustentable
Lázaro Cárdenas Norte No. 125, San Pedro Tultepec
Lerma, Estado de México 52030
México
Tel: y Fax: 527 28 282 0469
mindahi@prodigy.net.mx

Correa, Adriana Nelly
Profesor Investigador
Centro de Calidad Ambiental - ITESM
Campus Monterrey
Av. Eugenio Garza Sada
No. 2501 Sur
Monterrey, Nuevo León 64849
México
Tel: 52 818 328 4032
Fax: 52 818 359 6280
ancs@itesm.mx

Sandoval, Carlos
Presidente
Consejo Nacional de Industriales
Ecologistas
Gabriel Mancera No. 1141
Col. del Valle
México, DF 03100
México
Tel: 52 555 559 1915
Fax: 52 55 575 2337
ecologia@conieco.com.mx

Silvan, Laura
Directora
Proyecto Fronterizo de Educación Ambiental
Paseo Estrella del Mar No. 1025 - 2A
Sección Coronado
Playas de Tijuana, Baja California 22200
México
Tel: 52 664 630 0590
Fax: 52 64 630 05 90
laurie@proyectofronterizo.org.mx

USA

Clarey, Patricia
Vice President of Government Relations
Health Net, Inc.
21650 Oxnard Street
Woodland Hills, California 91367
USA
Tel: 818 676 7667
Fax: 818 676 8591
Patricia.t.clarey@health.net

Desai, Dinkerrai
Environmental Coordinator
U.S. Army Material Command
Forth Monmouth
New Jersey 07703
USA
Tel: 732 532 1475
Fax: 732 532 6263
desai@mail1.monmouth.army.mil

Duran, Arturo
General Manager
Lower Valley Water District
1557 FM Road 1110
Clint, Texas 79836
USA
Tel: 915 791 4480
Fax: 915 791 4499
aduran@lvwd.org

Gardner, Jane
Manager and Counsel
Remediation Programs
Corporate Environmental Programs
General Electric Company
3135 Easton Turnpike
Fairfield, Connecticut 06431
Tel: 203 373 2932
Fax: 203 373 2683
Jane.gardner@corporate.ge.com

McDonald, Patricia
Consultant
4420 Berry Drive #3822
Wilson, Wyoming 83014
USA
Tel: 307 734 2758
Fax: 307 734 2758
pattyamcdonald@earthlink.net
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Commission for Environmental Cooperation Details</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bellefleur, Julie-Anne</strong></td>
<td>Council Secretary</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4310</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:jabellefleur@ccemtl.org">jabellefleur@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Brevé, Daniel</strong></td>
<td>Public Participation Coordinator</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4368</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:dbreve@ccemtl.org">dbreve@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Carpentier, Chantal Line</strong></td>
<td>Head, Environment, Economy &amp; Trade</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4336</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:clcarpentier@ccemtl.org">clcarpentier@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Cun, Mircea</strong></td>
<td>Net. Administrator</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4351</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:mmcun@ccemtl.org">mmcun@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Droga, Alain</strong></td>
<td>Assistant, Law and Policy</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4329</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:Adroga@ccemtl.org">Adroga@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Ferron-Trip, Spencer</strong></td>
<td>Media and Outreach Officer</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4331</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:sftripp@ccemtl.org">sftripp@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Garver, Geoffrey</strong></td>
<td>Head, SEM Unit</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4332</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:ggarver@ccemtl.org">ggarver@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Gómez, Yamirka</strong></td>
<td>Assistant to the Council Secretary</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4349</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:yamirkag@ccemtl.org">yamirkag@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>González, Ignacio</strong></td>
<td>Program Manager, Law and Policy</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4324</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:igonzalez@ccemtl.org">igonzalez@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Guerrero, Hernando</strong></td>
<td>Director, Mexico Liaison Office</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 52 555 659 5021</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Herrmann, Hans</strong></td>
<td>Head</td>
<td>Conservation of Biodiversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4340</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:hherman@ccemtl.org">hherman@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Hoth, Jürgen</strong></td>
<td>Program Manager</td>
<td>Conservation of Biodiversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4307</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:jhoth@ccemtl.org">jhoth@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Kirk, Douglas</strong></td>
<td>Managing Editor, English</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4352</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:dkirk@ccemtl.org">dkirk@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>López, Jesús Miguel</strong></td>
<td>Managing Editor, Spanish</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4358</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:mlopez@ccemtl.org">mlopez@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Loyd, Evan</strong></td>
<td>Director, Communications</td>
<td>Commission for Environmental Cooperation</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>393, rue St-Jacques Ouest</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Bureau 200</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Montreal</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Quebec H2Y 1N9</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Canada</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Tel: 514 350 4308</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><a href="mailto:elloyd@ccemtl.org">elloyd@ccemtl.org</a></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Commission for Environmental Cooperation — 10th Regular Session of the Council, 2003

Miller, Paul  
Program Manager  
Air Quality  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4326  
pmiller@ccemtl.org

Morin, Jocelyne  
JPAC Assistant  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4366  
jmorin@ccemtl.org

Nichols, Marilou  
Assistant, Pollutants and Health  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4341  
mnichols@ccemtl.org

Opalka, Katia  
Legal Officer, SEM Unit  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4337  
kopalka@ccemtl.org

Paz-Miller, Liliana  
Coordinator, Meeting Services  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4313  
lpmiller@ccemtl.org

Pepin, Manon  
JPAC Liaison Officer / NAFEC Supervisor  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4305  
mpepin@ccemtl.org

Sbert, Carla  
Legal Officer, SEM Unit  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4321  
csbert@ccemtl.org

Schmidt, Karen  
Assistant, Conservation of Biodiversity  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4316  
kschmidt@ccemtl.org

Shantora, Victor  
Acting Executive Director  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4317  
vshantora@ccemtl.org

Silvaroli, Angela  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4364  
asilvaroli@ccemtl.org

Smith, Carol  
Translation Coordinator  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4346  
csmith@ccemtl.org

Sotelo, Olga  
Assistant, Meeting Services  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4343  
osotelo@ccemtl.org

Vulpescu, Mihaela  
NAFEC Assistant  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4357  
mvulpescu@ccemtl.org

Whitehouse, Tim  
Head, Law and Policy  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4334  
twhitehouse@ccemtl.org

Wright, Doug  
Director of Programs  
Commission for Environmental Cooperation  
393, rue St-Jacques Ouest  
Bureau 200  
Montreal  
Quebec H2Y 1N9  
Canada  
Tel: 514 350 4320  
dwright@ccemtl.org
Speakers at the 10TH Regular Session of the Council, 2003

José, Campillo  
Procurador  
PROFEPA  
Camino al Ajusco #200  
Col. Jardines en la Montaña  
México, DF 14210  
México  
Tel: 52 555 494 6300  
Fax: 52 555 440 2689  
procurador@correo.profepa.gob.mx

Case, Scott  
Director of Procurement Strategies  
Center for a New American Dream  
505 Penn Street, Suite 306  
Reading, Pennsylvania 19601  
USA  
Tel: 610 373 7703  
Fax: 610 373 1425  
scot@newdream.org

Cassanha Galvao, Luiz Augusto  
Program Coordinator  
Environmental Quality Program  
Pan American Health Organization  
World Health Organization  
525, 23rd Street, NW, Room 535  
USA  
Tel: 202 974 3156  
galvaolu@paho.org

Hamrin, Jan  
Executive Director  
Center for Resource Solutions  
Presidio Building # 97  
P.O. Box # 29512  
San Francisco, California 94129  
USA  
Tel: 415 561 2100  
Fax: 415 561 2105  
jhamrin@resource-solutions.org

Jensen, Kaj  
Director of Business Risk  
Corporate Environmental Affairs  
Fleet Boston Financial  
Mail Code CT/EH/402 20E  
Hartford, Connecticut 06102-5080  
USA  
Tel: 860 952 6305  
Fax: 860 952 6313  
kaj_l_jensen@fleet.com

Jones, Marshall  
Deputy Director  
U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service  
1849 C Street, N.W., Room 3256  
Washington, DC 20240  
USA  
Tel: 202 208 4545  
Fax: 202 208 6965  
marshall_jones@fws.gov

Ogilvie, Ken  
Executive Director  
Pollution Probe  
Traders Building, 625 Church Street  
suite 402  
Toronto, Ontario M4Y 2G1  
Canada  
Tel: 416 926 9876 x 231  
Fax: 416 926 1601  
kogilvie@pollutionprobe.org

Raab, Steven  
Vice President  
Environmental Health & Safety  
15 Wayside Road  
Burlington  
Massachusetts 01803-4609  
USA  
Tel: 781 993 3000 x 3035  
Fax: 781 993 3005  
sraab@intergen.com

Repetto, Robert  
Professor  
Yale Shool of Forestry and Environmental Studies  
200 Brook Placer  
Boulder, Colorado 80302  
USA  
Tel: 303 381 8226  
Fax: 303 381 8200  
robert.repetto@yale.edu

Román Moguel, Guillermo  
Director General  
Manejo Integral de Contaminantes  
SEMARNAT  
Av. Revolución No. 1425  
México, DF 01040  
México  
Tel: 52 555 624 3390  
Fax: 52 555 624 3690  
groman@semarnat.gob.mx

Studer, Isabel  
Profesor-investigador  
Facultad Latinoamericana de Ciencias Sociales  
Carretera al Ajusco No. 377  
Col. Héroes de Padierna  
México, DF 14200  
México  
Tel: 52 555 631 7246  
Fax: 52 555 593 4445  
isastuder@aol.com

Vaughan, Scott  
Distinguished Visiting Fellow  
Carnegie Endowment for International Peace  
1779 Massachusetts Ave. NW  
Washington, DC 20036  
USA  
Tel: 202 939 2303  
Fax: 202 483 4462  
svaughan@ceip.org
Special Observers at the 10TH Regular Session of the Council, 2003

Adria, Stephanie
Office of International Affairs
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Balkus, Daiva
Director of the Office of Cooperative Environmental Management
U.S. EPA
695 15th Street NW
Washington, DC 20005
USA
Tel: 202 233 0066
Fax: 202 233 0060
balkus.daiva@epa.gov

Beale, John
Deputy Assistant Administrator
Office of Air and Radiation
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Bearden, Janet
Acting Director, International Enforcement Division
Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 564 6245
Fax: 202 564 0073
bearden.janet@epa.gov

Berger, Martha
Office of Children’s Environmental Health
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Bridgeford, Tawny
Office of General Counsel
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Buka, Irena
Doctor
Child Health Clinic Misericordia Hospital
16940 87th Ave.
Edmonton, Alberta T5R 4H5
Canada
Tel: 780-930-5942
Fax: 780-481-4911

Carrillo, Oscar
NAC / GAC
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA
Tel: 202 233 0072
Fax: 202 233 0070
carrillo.oscar@epa.gov

Chanon, Keith E.
Office of Prevention, Pesticides, and Toxic Substances
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Christich, Peter
Office of International Affairs - U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA

Chu, Ed
Office of Children’s Environmental Health
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Clark, Karen
Western Hemisphere Officer
U.S. Department of the Interior
1849 C. St. NW MS - 4426
Washington, DC 20240
USA
Tel: 202 208 3004
Fax: 202 501 6381
karen_clark@ios.doi.gov

Cotter, Patrick
Office of International Affairs
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Dulaney, Steve
Photographer
U.S. EPA
Ariel Rios Building
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW
Washington, DC 20460
USA

Giannini-Spohn, Suzanne
Office of International Affairs
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Gilbreath, Jan
Office of International Affairs
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Herman, Chris
Office of International Affairs
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Hester, Luke
Press Officer
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Hoffer, Ron
Office of Water - U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Howard, John
Federal Executive
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA

Joyce, Mark
Senior Policy Advisor
U.S. EPA
655 15th Street NW
Washington, DC 20005
USA
Tel: 202 233 0068
Fax: 202 233 0070
joyce.mark@epa.gov

Keating, Terry
Environmental Scientist
Office of Air and Radiation
U.S. EPA
Washington, DC
USA
Kennedy, William  
Head  
Environmental Policy and Strategy  
European Bank for Reconstruction and Development  
10 Old Brewery Mews  
London, NW3 1PZ  
United Kingdom  
Tel: 44 207 338 6567  
kennedyw@ebrd.com

Kerr, Tom  
Chief, Energy Supply and Industry Branch  
Office of Air and Radiation  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Klubnikin, Kheryn  
Fish and Wildlife Group  
Research and Development  
Fish and Wildlife Service  
Washington, DC  
USA

Lallas, Peter  
Office of General Counsel  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Macias, Fernando  
Dep. General Manager  
Border Environment Cooperation Commission  
USA

McCully, Tom  
Chief of Staff  
Office of International Affairs  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

McDavit, Michael  
Special Assistant  
Office of the Administrator  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

McMurray, Claudia  
DA Chief of Staff  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

McNeil, Tucker  
Special Assistant  
Office of the Administrator  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Mersfelder-Lewis, Lynne  
NOAA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Metcalfe, Jane  
Office of International Affairs  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Muchling, Brian  
Office of International Affairs  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Mulvaney, Susan  
Deputy Chief of Staff  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Paterson, Arthur  
NOAA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Penn, Amanda  
Agricultural Marketing Specialist  
Foreign Agricultural Service  
U.S. Dept. of Agriculture  
Washington, DC  
USA

Perry, Simona  
NOAA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Petruccelli, Kathy  
Director of Management and Operations  
Office of International Affairs  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Picardi, Rick  
International Team  
Office of Solid Waste and Emergency Response  
U.S. EPA  
Ariel Rios Building  
1200 Pennsylvania Ave. NW  
Washington, DC 20460  
USA  
Tel: 703 308 8879  
Fax: 703 308 0514  
Picardi.rick@epa.gov

Poole, Silvonia  
Office of International Affairs  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Rock, Bud  
Principal Deputy Assistant Secretary  
OES  
U.S. Dept. of State  
Washington, DC  
USA

Roth, Dana  
OES/ETC  
U.S. Dept. of State  
Washington, DC  
USA

Rubin, James  
Assistant Section Chief, Policy, Environmental & Natural Resources Division  
U.S. Dept. of Justice  
Washington, DC  
USA

Scott, Jeff  
Office of International Affairs  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Sowell, Sarah  
Senior Advisor on North American Air Quality  
Office of Air and Radiation  
U.S. EPA  
Washington, DC  
USA

Tajbakhsh, Melinda  
Fish and Wildlife Service  
Washington, DC  
USA
Updike, Beverly
OECA
USA

Vetter, Darci
Director of Sustainable Development
U.S. Trade Representative
Washington, DC
USA

Wardzinski, Karen
Asst. Section Chief, Policy, Env. & Natural Resources Division
U.S. Dept. of Justice
Washington, DC
USA

Washburn, Kathryn
International Office
U.S. Department of the Interior
Washington, DC
USA

Weinstein, Deborah
Policy Analysis
U.S. Department of the Interior
Washington, DC
USA
National and Governmental Advisory Committees

Collette, Charles
Senior Assistant General Counsel
Florida Dept. of Environmental Protection
PO Box 10161
3900 Commonwealth Blvd., MS 35
Tallahassee, Florida 32302-2161
USA
Tel: 850 245 2220
Fax: 850 245 2297
chip.collette@dep.state.fl.us

Colvin, Michael
Government Consultant
436 Michael Ave.
Westerville, Ohio 43081-1812
USA
Tel: 614 895 3323
mikecolvin@columbus.rr.com

Gover, Lisa
Program Coordinator
National Tribal Environmental Council
2501 Rio Grande Blvd NW Suite A
Albuquerque
New Mexico 87104
USA
Tel: 505 242 2175
Fax: 505 242 2654
lgover@ntec.org

Greene, Adam
Director, Corporate Responsibility
USCIB
1212 Ave. of the Americas, Suite 2100
New York, New York 10036
USA
Tel: 212 703 5056
Fax: 212 575 0327
agreene@uscib.org

Kalbacher, Karl
City Councilman
City of Newark - Delaware
420 Arbou Drive
Newark, Delaware 19713
USA
Tel: 410 537 3447
Fax: 410 537 3472
kkalbacher@mde.state.md.us

Knox, John
Professor
Penn State
150 South College St.
Carlisle, Pennsylvania
USA
Tel: 717 241 3904
Fax: 717 240 5126
jkhknox@psu.edu

Lile, Sarah
Director
Department of Environmental Affairs
City of Detroit
First National Building
660 Woodward Ave. Suite 800
Detroit, Michigan 48226
USA
Tel: 313 471 5100
Fax: 313 471 5139
liles@envafrs.ci.detroit.mi.us

Luna, Cesar
Environmental Attorney
Bournazian & Luna
110 West C. Street, # 812
San Diego, California 92101
USA
Tel: 619 702 6530
Fax: 619 702 3464
cesar@bournazian-luna.com

Mahfood, Stephen
Director
Missouri Department of Natural Resources
P.O. Box 176
Jefferson City, Missouri 65102
USA
Tel: 573 751 4732
Fax: 573 751 7627
nrmahfs@dnr.state.mo.us

Martínez, Ricardo
Assistant Secretary
California Environmental Protection Agency
1001 I Street
Sacramento, California 95814
USA
Tel: 916 324 7316
Fax: 916 445 6401
rmartine@calepa.ca.gov

Matz, James
Mayor
City of Palm Valley
900 Palm Valley Drive West
Harlingen, Texas 78552
USA
Tel: 956 423 8030
Fax: 956 427 8031
gmatz@matzbldg.com

Morell, Aldo A.
Director
DuPont Safety
Health and Environment Excellence Center
DuPont
1007 Market Street
DuPont Bldg. Room 6088
Wilmington, Delaware 19898
USA
Tel: 302 773 0966
Fax: 302 774 3140
aldo.morell@usa.dupont.com

Perras, Jean
President
National Advisory Commetee - Canada
3 Chemin des Castors
Chelsea, Quebec J9B 1B8
Tel: 819 827 5036
leblanc.perras@videotron.ca

Ruvin, Hervey
Clerk of the Courts
Miami-Dade County Courthouse
73 West Flagler Street, Suite 242
Miami, Florida 33130
USA
Tel: 305 275 1155
Fax: 305 349 7403
clerk@miami-dadeclerk.com

Salas, Fernando
Vice Presidente
Grupo Salas Consultores
Acordada No. 47
México, DF 03900
México
Tel: 52 558 590 2903
Fax: 52 558 590 2905
fersalas@solescon.com

Wesson, Dolores
Deputy Director
California Sea Grant College Program
University of California - San Diego
9500 Gilman Drive, Dept. 0232
La Jolla, California 92039-0232
USA
Tel: 858 534 0576
Fax: 858 534 2231
dwesson@ucsd.edu

Williams, Charles M.
Professor
Dept. of Animal & Poultry Science
University of Saskatchewan
51 Campus Drive, 6D34 Agriculture Bldg.
Saskatoon, Saskatchewan S7N 5A8
Canada
Tel: 306 966 4157
Fax: 301 966 4151
williamsch@sask.usask.ca
JPAC Workshop on CEC Assessments of Transboundary Air Issues

24 June 2003
Washington, DC

Summary Record1

Opening Remarks

Gustavo Alanís-Ortega, the 2003 Chair of the Joint Public Advisory Committee (JPAC) of the Commission for Environmental Cooperation (CEC), welcomed everyone to the workshop and explained that, following the presentations, comments from JPAC and the public would be solicited on the areas and questions that had been circulated in advance of the meeting. He explained that the results of the discussion would be reported to Council during an in-camera session later in the day.

Overview of CEC Assessments of Transboundary Air Issues

Paul Miller, CEC Program Manager, Pollutants and Health, explained that this was the first meeting of the North American Air Working Group (NAAWG) and that the areas under discussion in this session emerged from the CEC’s Article 13 study on the electricity market. In 2002, the Council Communiqué identified areas for further work. The scope of the work program has not yet been determined and input is being sought from JPAC and the public on what would be the most fruitful area for CEC involvement in this area, understanding this is a multiyear effort and that resources are limited? Possibilities include:

1. Conduct a comparative study of the air quality standards, regulations, planning and enforcement practices at the national, state/provincial and local levels in the three countries, building on previous research and work undertaken by the CEC on the air management systems of the three countries.

2. Conduct a survey to obtain information on the comparability of North American environmental standards governing construction and operation of electricity generating facilities.

Comments from the public and JPAC included:

- Work on pollution prevention would be more interesting and productive rather than surveying legal systems—something that would take years.
- How will JPAC and the NAAWG coordinate their work? We must ensure that we are not “going over the same ground, plowing separate furrows.”

1 DISCLAIMER: Although this summary was prepared with care, readers should be advised it has not been approved by the intervenors or the Parties and therefore may not accurately reflect their statements.
• It was suggested that the process used for multi-stakeholder participation in developing air emissions standards in Alberta be explored as a model—a process where industry, government and NGOs are engaged in developing a consensus and decisions are then implemented by government. There has been a high degree of successful implementation and compliance. The web site is <www.casahome.org>.

• It is difficult to develop a methodology to assess cumulative impacts and risks. We have to make sense of what has happened in relation to public health.

• Other parts of the CEC Air Program are working on point sources and emissions inventories and developing information for models of air quality planning. Are methods transferable? Can there be common methods: for example, there is no equivalent to backyard pottery kilns as point sources in Canada or the US?

• Some countries have very heavily damaged ozone layers. It is important to work on risk-based standards. Many already exist and should be explored. (Mr. Miller made it clear that it is not the intention to develop standards, rather to generate information to inform decision-makers.)

• There seems to be a strong focus on research in an effort to better understand the various ways the three countries are handling air quality issues. How could this be complemented with reduction and prevention goals?

• The work needs to be focused. We have a good study on electricity. The point is—what is the impact? We should now get down to issues and measures. A graduate student could do this in six months. We are getting lost in backyard kilns when we should be focused on electricity facilities in our air sheds. What are the transboundary impacts of electricity plants?

• Where is the working group in this discussion? They were supposed to give us details. We are wasting our time, just chatting. We have no context. They were supposed to make presentations at the beginning. (It was explained that they were in an in-camera session with the Council and would arrive later).

• We are disappointed by the lack of progress of the working group. There are many serious issues to look at. For example, 30 permits from out-of-state developers for electricity facilities are being reviewed in Arizona alone.

• We should also be looking at related water-use issues. The proliferation of electricity generating plants creates huge demands for water. These are clearly transboundary matters. Also, the transmission lines often go through the poorest neighborhoods or sites of historical and ecological value. I would want the working group to issue guidelines on how to approach the problem in local areas.

• How do we get down to business in the areas and communities where problems exist? We have already done our own research with the American Lung Association and Harvard University. What we need now is a commitment to support the campaigns that already exist in our countries. We are not asking that the facilities be shut down, simply that they be updated and use modern filtration techniques to reduce up to 90 to 95% of the emissions. (The speaker was referring specifically to facilities in the area of Chicago.)

• There are 50 mega plants being planned along the Mexican border. Over 1 million people will be affected. These are US companies operating in Mexico. They are engaged in “CO₂ laundering.”

• As a final conclusion, you should adopt the highest standards in all three countries.
• Energy efficiency and new technologies should also be part of the work. The air work should also be linked with the CEC’s work on biodiversity, children’s health and enforcement. Also, the work plan should look at initiatives for public education. Governments are doing a lot of work in this area.

• We should be focusing on reduction and prevention for environmental protection and human health. Examples exist of programs to replace farming equipment with internal combustion engines with more efficient technologies. The result is energy efficiency and cleaner water.

• We are off into all kinds of different directions. We should be looking at the best and highest standards in all three counties as a goal and focus on the electricity industry and border issues.

**The NAAWG members presentations**

The NAAWG Chair explained that the working group had convened in conformity with CEC Council Resolution 02-04, “North American Air Working Group,” and had held its first meeting the previous day, on 23 June.

The mandate of the group includes the development of a long-term strategic plan with a commitment to include the public. A timeline has now been approved and distributed to JPAC. A further public meeting will be organized early in 2004 on a draft strategic plan. Clearly, electricity should be the focus and developing a trinational initiative for the energy sector will be a first goal. The group will also look at transportation, including rail and marine.

Another member explained that the group would also be looking to develop a pilot project on monitoring at a border area. The strategic vision will also include technical questions and a commitment to consult the public on related social issues. Capacity building and developing new technologies are key, particularly for Mexico.

**Comments from the public and JPAC included:**

• Are there specific plans to involve the private sector, including small and medium-size enterprises (SMEs)?

• Smaller enterprises are a real challenge. We will need to make specific efforts [with them].

• We need to ensure that efforts are not redundant or duplicative of other work already going on bilaterally or within the private sector.

• Look at private sector strategies for pollution prevention together for more effective results.

• Encouraging the use of public transportation through urban planning is where it all begins—this is where the behaviour of individuals can be positively affected. Urban design determines vehicle use.

• Along with the timeline, we need to see a proposed outcome. We are straying from the original mandate—transboundary issues around electricity generation. What is attainable in 12 months? What can we actually improve in the three countries?

• Canada will be revisiting Canada-wide standards for ambient levels—and the US/Canada ozone agreement that sets caps. This will lead to concrete action.
3. **Identify, explore and address issues related to barriers, challenges, opportunities and principles under which emissions trading systems might evolve.**

- On emissions trading, given that Canada and US have already committed to a feasibility study on how to conduct emissions trading between the two nations (see bilateral agreement: *Strengthening Our Cooperation for Cleaner Air*, signed on 22 June 2003, in Washington, DC) what more can we add? We should urge them towards success rather than spend scarce resources on the same issue.
- Work with such agreements to explore potential for trinational applications.
- What is the status of the CEC-sponsored pilot project on greenhouse gas trading in Mexico? Mr. Miller replied that no decision has yet been taken and opportunities were being explored.

In conclusion, JPAC stated that the meeting was perhaps premature and that the questions posed are highly technical and would best be explored by the NAAWG. JPAC could be much more involved in commenting on a substantive document.

Mr. Miller thanked all the participants and reiterated the commitment to continued public involvement in the development of the work plans.

Prepared by Lorraine Brooke
7 July 2003
ANNEX D

Public Plenary Session on CEC North American Environmental Enforcement and Compliance Cooperation Program

23 June 2003
Washington, DC

Summary Record

Opening Remarks

Gustavo Alanís-Ortega, the 2003 chair of the Joint Public Advisory Committee (JPAC) of the Commission for Environmental Cooperation (CEC), made introductory remarks. He explained the mandate and role of JPAC. In its Advice to Council 02-11 on the proposed CEC Program Plan and Budget for 2003–20005, JPAC recommended that a public meeting with the North American Environmental Enforcement and Compliance Working Group (EWG) be held in conjunction with the June 2003 Regular Session of Council to seek input on a long-term strategic plan.

In March 2003, JPAC met with the EWG to present a draft agenda for the June joint meeting and outlined a possible long-term strategic plan as follows:

1. Identify gaps in domestic legal systems and international agreements that may impede transboundary enforcement cooperation, focusing on:
   a) The movement of substances that pose a threat to public health, the environment, and endangered species; and
   b) Instances where a Canadian, Mexican or a US company may have “used the border as a shield” to avoid environmental liability in another NAFTA country (i.e., a Metales y Derivados type of situation).
2. Provide recommendations to Council on building up information systems and improving domestic legal systems and policies based on the gaps identified in the first point.
3. Seek linkages related to enforcement issues with the other CEC programs, in particular, with Pollutants and Health.
4. Promote transparency in the development and the implementation of the EWG program to maximize public involvement.

The JPAC chair encouraged the active participation of the attending public to assist JPAC in developing a focus for its continuing involvement with the North American Environmental Enforcement and Compliance Working Group (EWG).

1 DISCLAIMER: Although this summary was prepared with care, readers should be advised it has not been approved by the intervenors or the Parties and therefore may not accurately reflect their statements.
José Campillo Garcia, chair of EWG, presented the draft Strategic Plan. He stressed the importance of developing networks, focusing on trade in hazardous waste, and training customs agents. He further explained that an upcoming CEC Workshop on Environmental Legislation will focus on gaps in legal systems that could prevent effective cooperation, the need for increased cooperation and coordination, the importance of voluntary mechanisms, including working with small and medium-size enterprises, and the role of citizens.

Tim Whitehouse, head of the CEC Law and Policy Program, welcomed the participants and explained the purpose of this public session—stressing the power of public knowledge and the need to focus on issues and concrete results that improve the environment and protect public health. He thanked JPAC for its involvement.

Overview of Country Enforcement Priorities

Office of Enforcement and Compliance Assurance, US EPA

Phyllis Harris, deputy assistant administrator for the US EPA, thanked JPAC for pursuing transparency and public participation. She explained that the US EPA also strives for public participation in identifying priorities and has recently produced a policy document on public participation. She described the “Smart Enforcement” program, which uses the most appropriate tools to address the most significant problems and achieve the best outcomes:

- Addressing significant environmental and public health compliance problems,
- Using data,
- Using the most appropriate tool to achieve the best outcome,
- Evaluating effectiveness, and
- Evaluating outcomes.

She elaborated on her agency’s support for environmental management systems, corporate environmental stewardship and generating environmentally relevant information, along with the need for public disclosure and information sharing.

She explained that EPA’s sister agency, the Fish and Wildlife Service is working to restore the nation’s enforcement capability by training and hiring new agents with a focus on the illegal trade in wildlife and the conservation of species of international concern.

Environmental Protection Service, Environment Canada

Daniel Couture, deputy director of Environment Canada’s enforcement branch, explained the unique challenges in Canada, where jurisdiction is shared with the provinces and territorial governments. The lead federal agencies are Environment Canada and the Department of Fisheries and Oceans. At the federal level, the focus is on wildlife conservation and pollution prevention.

Regarding wildlife, the priorities are:

- Implementing the new Species at Risk Act,
- Determining joint approaches for effective protection, using all available legislation,
- Focusing on organized crime networks, and
- Pursuing intelligence gathering, capacity building and cooperation.

Regarding pollution prevention, the focus is on:

- Transborder hazardous waste, particularly ozone-depleting substances;
- New control instruments, smart regulations, pollution prevention plans, increased focus on biosecurity; and
- Interagency cooperation.

He concluded by saying that Canada is now focusing on enhancing capacity to acquire knowledge and information and apply it to effective enforcement.

**The Federal Attorney for Environmental Protection (Profepa)**

Gabriel Calvillo, director of Profepa’s Federal Environmental Crimes and Litigation unit, explained recent changes in legislation regarding public disclosure of information and integration of public policy in enforcement. Priorities for Profepa are:

- Inspection and monitoring,
- Enforcing laws,
- Voluntary controls,
- Investigation,
- Illegal traffic in hazardous waste,
- Remediation and fines, and
- Encouraging public involvement in identifying violators.

The strategy for 2003 will be to inspect high-risk facilities, developing voluntary mechanisms particularly for small or medium-size enterprises (SME), air pollution and implementing international obligations (Kyoto).

Concerning natural resources, the priorities are investigation of criminal activities with a focus on forests, implementation of international conventions, biotechnology and genetically modified organisms (GMOs) and data collection.

**Question Period**

Questions posed included:

In the case of Canada and the US, what are the opportunities of public participation in existing legislation?
Also, in Mexico, what is being done to promote public denunciation of violators?
Finally what does each country want to do to better enforce their laws?

Replies:
In the US, there are many areas for public participation, including the Toxics Release Inventory (TRI) and other data systems, citizen suit provisions, and public comment on settlements, to name a few. Through the regional offices, citizens can make reports and file complaints. The Superfund provides for extensive public participation in clean up. Just recently, Governor Whitman released a policy on public participation in all EPA programs.

In Canada, regarding pollution prevention the Canadian Environmental Protection Act (CEPA) allows a citizen to request an investigation. Reports that are produced for parliament are public documents. A new web site—Greenline—provides all this information along with a registry of cases and enforcement actions.

Canada has committed new resources to increase the number of inspectors and enforcement officers. Under CEPA, they are accorded the same powers as peace officers.

In Mexico, the media and the Internet are used to encourage citizen complaints. However, it is understood that a large part of the population does not have access to electronic media and so new means of communication are being developed. There is now a new unit on illegal activities that publishes lists of violators. New programs for environmental controls are also being developed especially for SMEs.

Question/comment:

JPAC is trying to establish links between environment performance and financial performance. How is this being pursued in the three countries?

Replies:

In the US, the EPA has been working with the Securities and Exchange Commission (SEC) on issues related to the disclosure of environmental information, particularly the disclosure of environmental legal proceedings, in accordance with SEC’s existing regulations. EPA shares information with the SEC on an ongoing basis for investigation and enforcement purposes.

In Canada, there is no such formal agreement. In specific investigations, Environment Canada works with the Royal Canadian Mounted Police to make the link with financing.

Question/comment:

How are indigenous peoples involved in setting standards for enforcement and compliance? In Canada, for example, the situation is quite adversarial. Efforts are required to change that. Indigenous peoples have their own customs and elders should be involved in developing enforcement mechanisms. For indigenous peoples, the main test is whether or not the environment remains healthy—then the people will be healthy. There exist international conventions (Convention on Biological Diversity and Convention 169, concerning Indigenous and Tribal People in Independent Countries, of the International Labour Organisation) where the rights of indigenous peoples are recognized. These need to be implemented domestically. One way is to allocate the resources necessary to build capacity for indigenous peoples to do their own monitoring and enforcement.
Replies:

In Canada, there are requirements to consult with indigenous peoples (and others) when developing new regulations. In many instances, partnership agreements are developed with individual aboriginal communities. Clearly more is needed.

In the US, the government has a fiduciary responsibility with tribes. The focus is on capacity building to help them develop and administer their own programs and set their own standards on tribal lands. Key areas where the EPA is focusing are on drinking water and management of solid wastes.

In Mexico, Profepa concentrates on supporting community controls to implement the law. There are continuing efforts to develop better mechanisms to involve indigenous peoples in conservation and land issues.

Question/comment:

We attempt to measure enforcement by counting violations and complaints rather than by measuring results. Laws and regulations should be tools, not goals. What is the impact of legislation on the environment should be the key question. In Mexico, enforcement could be improved by providing regular updates and information on regulations. Lack of information and the complexity of the system encourage noncompliance. Also, salaries of inspectors need to be increased. The turnover is too high and corruption results. At the border, more resources are required for the volume of traffic. The border is paralyzed by load-by-load inspections.

Replies:

In Mexico, we agree that we should not be measuring compliance by counting complaints and violations and rather should be developing new indictors to measure results. We also agree that there is a need to improve training and salaries and develop a cadre of professionals who will stay on the job.

In the US, the Smart Enforcement program is moving away from just counting complaints and violations and looking at ways to measure outcomes. More effort is also needed on identifying geographic areas. The EPA also encourages companies to submit remedial projects in lieu of fines (supplemental environmental projects).

Question/comment:

There is an urgent need to develop a trilateral cooperative approach to regulating cruise ships. There are 2000 calls per day in Cozumel for example! There are huge damages to the coral reefs. How can the CEC help?

Replies:
This will be a topic for the EWG. It is a serious problem in all three countries. This is a prime area for international cooperation.

Question/comment:

Regulations and legislation need to be more flexible and respond to community situations. For example, in many instances local police cannot enforce laws and yet it is at the local level that day-to-day effects are encountered and suffered by local people. Coal-fired power plants located close to poor communities and trucking routes through populated areas are examples.

Replies:

In the US, coal-fired power plant emissions constitute a major priority for the EPA, as are diesel engines. New regulations will be announced soon. The EPA is proceeding with aggressive negotiations and linking environmental harm to enforcement settlements. Funds are then created to retrofit school buses, for example.

Question/comment:

The focus on economic development is creating serious problems for indigenous peoples in northern Canada. North of the 50th parallel, the lands and waters are essentially still pristine, but that is changing quickly. When a region gets opened up to development, roads are built and non-indigenous peoples move in. Language is lost and culture destroyed. The land is contaminated and wildlife moves out. If the environment is destroyed, we are destroyed.

Inequities in enforcement must be addressed. In the Oaxaca region, for example, an indigenous person was arrested for possessing turtle eggs that are part of his peoples’ traditional diet. Turtles are protected. However, in the same area is located one of the country’s largest oil refineries, which is known to be severely polluting the waters and destroying turtle habitat—but nothing happens to the owners of the refinery.

Replies:

In Profepa, there is now a shift from strict environmental protection to environmental justice. This is a good example in support of this shift. There must be a balancing of interests. For example, exemptions should be put in place for plants and wildlife that are part of traditional diets and religious practices of indigenous peoples.

**Presentation on the Illegal Traffic of Ozone-depleting Substances**

Bruce Pasfield, assistant chief, Environmental Crimes Section, Environment and Natural Resources Division, US Department of Justice, explained that we are at the peak of the thinning of the ozone layer. In 1920s and 30s, industrial chemicals began to be widely used. In 1950s, the substances that made them so useful were discovered to make them harmful to the ozone layer. Because it takes so long for these chemicals to get up to the ozone layer, we are seeing most effects only now.
The 1978 Montreal Protocol set up a process to gradually phase out the use of these chemicals. From 1978–86 the phase-out schedule was voluntary. Then phase-out caps were created with a target date of 1996 for the elimination of these chemicals by developed countries. Developing countries were given until 2010. From an enforcement standpoint this is a problem. Mexico is a CFC-producing country, the third-largest in the world, producing 7500 tons of CFCs every year. A good portion exported to other developing countries. Two to five tons come into the US annually through illegal markets. The CEC Task Force has been instrumental in working on solutions. We meet every three to four months and are making good progress.

Mexico is just entering its phase-out schedule, which began in 2000. There is good cooperation on specific cases. The CEC could provide assistance in helping develop a better licensing system in Mexico for tracking that would be more consistent with the systems in the rest of North America. The CEC sponsored a conference in February 2003 in Monterrey, Mexico. Until there is a better legislative framework in Mexico, capacity building will be hampered. Now we need to focus on the second generation of these chemicals—replacement chemicals. They, too, are restricted, with phase-out targets in 2010.

Training also needs to be coordinated between environmental protection, tracking of hazardous wastes, wildlife and trade in endangered species. UNEP, for example, is developing a program to train on all these issues. He urged the CEC to encourage integrated training—to achieve a “Green Customs.”

Presentation on the Environmentally Sound Management and Tracking of Hazardous Wastes

Rick Picardi, Office of Solid Waste, US EPA, explained the differences in hazardous waste requirements in the three countries and the mandate received from the CEC Council to work on ‘cradle to grave’ monitoring in North America. While most substances stay in North America, once they cross a border, they can get ‘lost.’ This causes hazardous waste “spikes” from one country to another.

He went on to explain the work of the Hazardous Waste Task Force, which focuses not just on enforcement but on achieving a better understanding of the situation. Currently the Task Force is working on a comparative analysis of selected hazardous waste requirements in three countries and identifying tracking processes in each country and assessing the feasibility of linking national tracking systems.

Future work will include a public workshop in cooperation with JPAC on best practices in electronic tracking of hazardous waste, proposing a Council Resolution for 2004, working on environmentally sound management (ESM), possibly developing voluntary guides on ESM best practices, and finally evolving a pilot project on electronic transmission of export notices.

Presentation on Wildlife Enforcement

Yvan Lafleur, director of wildlife enforcement, Environmental Canada, described NAWEG’s mandate as:

- Fostering regional approaches to enforcement obligations,
- Building regional capacity and expertise, and
- Sharing information to deliver wildlife enforcement programs.

The group’s focus is on combating illegal activities despite the limited resources in each country. He reviewed the capacity building work of NAWEG over the last seven years, as well as other activities in publications, outreach and training. NAWEG is now recognized by international agencies as the contact for the North American region.

NAWEG is open to public involvement in development and direction of the program. It is more difficult, however, to have public involvement in actual cases and investigations.

Strategic Plan for NAWEG (2002):

- Supports the objective of the trilateral committee (must be trilateral—not bilateral),
- Compatible with the EWG’s proposed strategy,
- Supporting the mandates of partners (three countries) in conserving wildlife, and
- Open to public involvement.

Next Steps:

- More interaction with Caribbean and Central American wildlife enforcement agencies. NGOs and trade industry perspectives are invited.
- Seminars on intelligence gathering, analysis and sharing, wildlife enforcement and management, and invasive species. A lot of illegal trade occurs via the Internet.
- Participation in GWEN—Global Wildlife Enforcement Network.

He noted that funding remains a major limitation in improving capacity and capability.

Presentation on Environmental Management Systems

Lorenzo Thomas, director of environmental auditing, Profepa, explained that the EMS Task Force began in 1996 and he reviewed its work over the past seven years. In June 2000, the Task Force issued a Guidance Document: Improving Environmental Performance and Compliance – 10 Elements of Effective Environmental Management Systems. He reviewed those 10 elements. (Please note the document is available on the CEC web site at <www.ccemtl.org>.)

He noted that several years ago, JPAC recommended that CEC move out of this area and leave it to national processes. The Task Force feels that there is still much to do and Council agreed, highlighting the needs in the 2001 and 2002 Council Communiqués. In 2003, the focus of the work will be on training for inspectors and prevention versus penalties.
Comments:

- EMS is very important for the private sector, particularly for small and medium-size businesses. How can Profepa, with its limited budget, increase the number of inspectors to work with these industries? (JPAC was encouraged to bring this to the attention of Council. The lack of resources is overwhelming in Mexico.)
- It is would be useful to work directly with industry to inventory and evaluate progress.
- It is important to develop indicators of effectiveness to measure the impact of the work—successes and failures.
- Counting seizures can still be a good barometer for measuring the scale of problems.
- The EMS’s 10 elements document has been helpful. Now it would be important to acknowledge progress through seals of performance.
- More attention is required on the Mexican border. The situation is becoming dramatic for its impacts on human health. The increase in border patrols has now funnelled people into the harshest areas, resulting in many deaths. People used to drown in the Rio Grande; now they die in the desert. The fences and other ‘blocks’ are also inhibiting the movement of wildlife. The US is now proposing to build a 10ft-high concrete and steel wall along the border with stadium-level light and a high-speed highway in between. This will have dreadful impacts on people and wildlife.

Long-term Strategic Plan for the CEC North American Environmental Enforcement and Compliance Cooperation Program

The members presented the long-term strategic plan. It will be put out for a 60-day public comment period and is available on the CEC web site at www.ccemtl.org.

Comments:

- The infrastructure and technology need to be adequate to implement the plan.
- Ensure that the Parties commit themselves to undertaking the necessary reforms so that the legal framework addresses the deficiencies.
- Keep abreast of what other groups are doing and provide a North American perspective.
- Link with the outcomes from the World Summit on Sustainable Development
- Make training needs more explicit.
- Disseminate information to promote enforcement.
- Link activities with national audit systems (Canada’s Environmental Auditor, US Inspector General and Mexico’s Attorney General’s Office).
- Members of civil society, and particularly indigenous peoples, need to be included in the work.
- Ensure compliance with NAFTA’s Chapter 11.
- Engage all levels of government (municipal up to national).
- Prioritize and focus. Do not take on too much at first.
- Pay attention to vulnerable communities and promote environmental justice.

Prepared by Lorraine Brooke
7 July 2003
11 July 2003

Mr. Jose Campillo
Semarnat
Chair of the North American Working Group on Environmental Enforcement and Compliance Cooperation

RE: Follow-up to the Plenary Public Session on the CEC North American Environment Enforcement and Compliance Cooperation Program

Dear Mr. Campillo:

On behalf of the Joint Public Advisory Committee (JPAC), first let me extend sincere thanks to the North American Working Group on Environmental Enforcement and Compliance Cooperation (EWG) for participating in the Plenary Public Session on the CEC North American Environment Enforcement and Compliance Cooperation Program, held on 23 June 2003, in Washington, DC.

While the purpose of the Plenary Session was to consult the public on your draft long-term strategic plan, the country presentations that preceded this discussion were extremely useful and informative, as witnessed by the degree of interest expressed by the public. The frank exchanges between agency representatives and participants were a demonstration of the value and benefits of transparency and dialogue.

Many important comments and recommendations on your work emerged from the Plenary Session, and these will be reported in the Summary Record for this session. However, JPAC feels that several of these merit special mention:

- The need to develop the capacity for measuring impacts of law enforcement on the environment, as well as impacts from the lack of legislation or regulations;
- Disseminating information to encourage and promote compliance;
- Keeping pace with evolving international instruments by ensuring effective involvement of indigenous peoples and affected populations in policy development, the elaboration of appropriate enforcement mechanisms and decision-making, drawing on traditional knowledge and respectful of customary practices; and
- Notice to Council that compliance must be supported by additional investment, particularly in Mexico for training, capacity building, technology transfer and infrastructure development.

Regarding the draft long-term strategic plan specifically, JPAC members raised several points during the session, which we would like to reiterate for your consideration as you develop the final document.
We would suggest that you:

- Prioritize and re-group the strategic objectives, using risk assessment as a criterion;
- Highlight the need for adjustments to legislation and regulations that will be required for effective implementation;
- Emphasize the need to develop indicators to measure the environmental and health benefits resulting from enforcement actions;
- Engage municipal, indigenous, state, territorial and provincial governments;
- Require the development a strategy for involving industry and the private sector with an emphasis on capacity building and training for small and medium sized businesses;
- Reference the importance of ensuring that the judiciary are knowledgeable in matters related to environmental enforcement and compliance issues;
- Reinforce cooperation with other international agencies and environmental law institutions to provide a North American perspective; and
- Add the words “with environmental legislation” to the end of Objective #10.

We look forward to receiving the final version of the long-term strategic plan following your public comment period. In the fall of 2003, JPAC will be reviewing the Proposed Program Plan and Budget for 2004–2006 and will provide an Advice to Council. At that time we will be in a better position to assess the extent to which it is reflected in your program of work.

Be assured of our continued cooperation.

Sincerely,

[original signed]

Gustavo Alanís-Ortega
JPAC Chair for 2003

cc: EWG Members
    CEC Alternate Representatives
    CEC Acting Executive Director
    CEC Head of Law and Policy Program
    JPAC Members
11 July 2003

Mr. Jeffrey R. Holmstead  
United States Environmental Protection Agency  
Chair of the North American Air Working Group

RE: Follow-up to the Public Workshop on CEC Assessments of Transboundary Air Issues

Dear Mr. Holmstead:

On behalf of the Joint Public Advisory Committee (JPAC), I would like to thank the North American Air Working Group (NAAWG) for participating in our public workshop on CEC Assessments of Transboundary Air Issues, held on 24 June 2003, in Washington, DC.

We understand that you are in the very preliminary stages of developing a strategic plan for this area of work, having met for the first time as a group on 23 June. JPAC attaches a very high priority to air issues and we were very pleased to learn of your desire to work collaboratively with JPAC and the public in the development and implementation of this strategic plan.

At this preliminary stage, we offer the following comments, based on our initial discussion and the input received during the public workshop. We would suggest that you:

- Recall Article 3 of the North American Agreement on Environmental Cooperation, which states that: “[R]ecognizing the right of each Party to establish its own levels of domestic environmental protection and environmental development policies and priorities, and to adopt or modify accordingly its environmental laws and regulations, each Party shall ensure that its laws and regulations provide for high levels of environmental protection and shall strive to continue to improve those laws and regulations”;
- Retain a focus on the original mandate issued by Council that attached this work to activities following up the Article 13 Report on Environmental Challenges and Opportunities of the Evolving North American Electricity Market;
- Pay special attention to pollution prevention, including energy efficiency, new technologies and alternative energy;
- Include education and outreach aimed at providing the general population and affected communities with up-to-date and reliable information on air quality; and
- Take into account and build on bilateral agreements including progress on developing emissions trading systems that might be applied on a continental basis.

Please take note that a summary record of the session will be available to you and the public in the near future for a full overview of the points raised during the workshop.
We welcome Council’s request that JPAC stay actively involved in your work and we look forward to our next joint public meeting on the draft strategic plan. Please be assured of JPAC’s assistance in developing appropriate means for meaningful public consultation.

Sincerely,

[original signed]

Gustavo Alanís-Ortega
JPAC Chair for 2003

cc: NAAWG Members
    CEC Alternate Representatives
    CEC Acting Executive Director
    CEC Air Program Manager
    JPAC Members