



COMMISSION FOR ENVIRONMENTAL COOPERATION
Joint Public Advisory Committee Session No. 00-03

13–14 October 2000
Washington DC

Summary Record

The Joint Public Advisory Committee (JPAC) of the North American Commission for Environmental Cooperation (NACEC) held a regular session on 13-14 October 2000 in Washington DC, in conjunction with the North American Symposium on Understanding the Linkages between Trade and Environment. A plenary discussion with the attending public was also held on the proposed NACEC Program Plan and Budget for 2001–2003.

This Summary Record reports on each agenda item, records all decisions made by the Committee and identifies action items and responsibilities. (See Annex A for the agenda, and Annex B for the list of participants)

Previous summary records, advice from JPAC to Council and other JPAC related documents may be obtained from the JPAC Liaison Officer's office or through NACEC's web site at <<http://www.cec.org/jpac>>.

DISCLAIMER: Although this summary was prepared with care, readers should be advised that it has not been reviewed nor approved by the intervenors and therefore may not accurately reflect their statements.

Friday, 13 October

Welcome and Overview by the Chair

JPAC Chair, Regina Barba, opened the meeting and welcomed everyone to Washington. She noted the absence, with reasons, of Johnathan Plaut, Mary Simon and Raúl Tornel. She informed the audience that Jonathan Scarth, a Canadian member, has resigned. She also noted that Serena Wilson and Blanca Torres were attending a parallel meeting of Trade and Environment Officials on Article 10(6) of the North American Agreement of Environmental Cooperation (NAAEC). Liette Vasseur attended the morning of 13 October. For the balance of the session she represented JPAC at a meeting of the Alternate Representatives.

Approval of the Provisional Agenda

The agenda was approved.

Report by the Executive Director and Question Period

The Chair introduced Janine Ferretti, Executive Director of NACEC. She reported on activities since the Council Session in Dallas.

- The Secretariat has developed the program and budget for 2001. It is very important that this document be available to the Parties by early fall for approval by the end of December. There has been an attempt to streamline the program and to introduce more science-based work.
- There was a strategic decision taken to create synergies by developing partnerships for leveraging additional funds for specific projects. For example, discussions have been held with the Pan American Health Organization to work on implementing the NARAP on DDT. Other areas with partnership potential are trade and environment and, marine protected areas where NACEC can bring a North American perspective and experience to UNEP's work. Discussions are also taking place within the private sector for work on sustainable development.
- Update on status of submissions is available on the NACEC web page. NACEC was informed that the Supreme Court of Canada denied leave to appeal to the Friends of the West Country regarding the Sunpine Forest Products case. Council will review the information in light of Council's Resolution regarding the Submission.
- Regarding communications activities, the Secretariat has issued a new brochure and a new quarterly newsletter—*Trio*. The Secretariat is happy to receive any comments on the new bulletin.
- Program evaluation and monitoring was launched in the Mexico City liaison office and the Law and Policy program will be evaluated at the end of the year.
- The report on dioxin release and transfer was released and well received by the indigenous community in Nunavut. Ms. Sheila Watt-Cloutier, President of Inuit Circumpolar Conference (Canada) participated in the press conference and was appreciative of NACEC's efforts to mainstream issues of concern to indigenous peoples.
- The Symposium (on trade and environment) was an excellent beginning and the Secretariat will now examine areas where further work is valuable.
- The Mexican Round Table on Pollution and Prevention was launched in August to promote pollution prevention in small and medium sized industries. As well, the report on results from the pollution prevention revolving fund for SMEs, FIPREV, is now available.

The Chair thanked Ms. Ferretti and expressed her support for the dioxin work and asked that it be translated into Spanish so it can be used in Mexico. She then opened the floor to questions.

Mateo Castillo, Coordinator for the Mexican NAC asked what steps JPAC and the Secretariat are taking to inform the new administration in Mexico about NACEC.

Ms. Ferretti replied that the Mexican transition team has asked NACEC to provide assistance on identifying programs and progress on environmental issues. Mr. Fox's past involvement with NACEC in the Silva Reservoir will help spawn future cooperation.

Eric Dannenmaier, of the North-South Center, suggested that while cooperation is often discussed it does not occur as often as it should. He asked the Executive Director for her ideas how this could be improved, understanding that there are resource constraints.

Ms. Ferretti replied that because the resource base is limited, it has forced the Secretariat take a much closer look at how it can best use the expertise that exists within other institutions, other international agencies and with the public. The DDT phase-out work in Mexico was ideally suited for funding from the Global Environment Facility (GEF). This experience can now be transferred to other regions in Central America. The World Bank and the Organization of American States is currently reviewing NACEC's program and identifying issues of common concern such as marine protected areas and transportation. She reported that by January 2001, key areas for partnership building would be identified.

Mr. Dannenmaier continued and asked if it were possible to share this North American experience beyond our region. Ms. Ferretti replied that NACEC's mission is North American and the resources cannot be stretched in this fashion, but that collaboration with other agencies could be possible.

Report by National and Governmental Advisory Committee Representatives

The Chair reported that new appointments had not yet been made to the Canadian National Advisory Committee (NAC) and that Mr. William Andrews had recently resigned.

John Knox, Chair of the United States NAC, reported that the NAC met in September. Regarding the Articles 14 and 15 process, the US NAC is very pleased with the new role of JPAC. Rather than respond as a Committee to the call for public comments on the JPAC review process and lessons learned, the NAC members were encouraged to provide comments as individuals.

The US NAC sent a letter regarding the proposed program plan and budget. The Committee strongly urged that the North American Fund for Environmental Cooperation (NAFEC) be continued while actively searching for more funding. They also recommend that there be a specific follow up developed for the Symposium (on trade and environment), and that it not be simply folded into the critical and emerging trends work.

Regarding Article 10(6) of the NAAEC, the US NAC urges increased openness and public participation; that NAFTA Chapter 11 cases that involve environmental issues should be addressed cooperatively; and that amicus briefs should be considered by the dispute resolution panel.

Mateo Castillo, Coordinator of the Mexican National Advisory Committee reported that there has been a 50% reduction in the Mexican NAC. There is no legal quorum and they have not met since the Council Session in June. Work is underway to have new members appointed but this will not likely happen before the administration changes later this year. They are preparing a “white book” on public consultation, participation and progress for the new administration.

Denise Ferguson-Southard, the recently elected Chair of the United States Governmental Advisory Committee (GAC), reported that the Committee met in September to follow up on the June Council Session, to discuss future direction of NACEC and to review the proposed program plan and budget for 2001–2003.

Regarding follow up of the Council Session, she reported that the Committee was impressed with the new format and approach to public participation and thanked NACEC staff for its efforts. She noted the GAC was very pleased with JPAC’s new role in the Article 14 and 15 process. Before the Council Session she noted that the GAC had been very worried about the future of this process and now they are “cautiously optimistic”. They are still very concerned, however, that submissions be treated efficiently.

She then recommended that NACEC engage in more long-term strategic planning to expand the vision of the organization. This could provide a platform for discussing the need for increased budgets. Expanding the constituency, increasing public awareness, using the NAFEC experience to put a human face on NACEC’s work would all be interesting topics for discussion. She also offered her committee’s help in enhancing the budget, adding that flat funding is the same as diminishing funding. She emphasized the importance of continuing NAFEC as a means of building a human infrastructure in the service of NACEC’s mission.

Regarding the proposed program plan, the GAC recommends that the Green Goods and Services project focus on a comparative approach versus a product by product approach. Within the work on biodiversity and ecoregions, there is a need to link marine protected areas with fisheries. Finally, the proposed meeting of health and environment ministers will help lay important groundwork for building a work program on children's health and the environment.

She then thanked Robert Varney for all of his work as past chair.

Report on the North American Symposium on Understanding the Linkages between Trade and Environment

Greg Block, NACEC Director of Programs, reported that the Symposium had been a watershed event. The challenge now will be to build on its success. He suggested that a first step could be a discussion of effects at the community level. It is important to look at the driving forces and root causes that may not always be NAFTA connected. He noted that many of the presentations mentioned the problem of lack of reliable monitoring and baseline environmental data. The NACEC cannot be the answer to this problem; the resources just do not exist. However, by networking with other organizations, NACEC can contribute perspective and expertise. Finally

he noted with enthusiasm the statements from the Mexican transition team concerning placing environment and sustainability at the heart of the new administration's development model.

Looking ahead, Mr. Block asked JPAC to provide advice on promising areas of inquiry. The Chair thanked Mr. Block and expressed her hope that similar commitments will be forthcoming from the new US and Canadian administrations concerning their commitment to the environment and sustainable development. She also stated that JPAC would be preparing an Advice to Council on follow-up work.

Action: JPAC

Presentation of the Proposed NACEC Program Plan and Budget for 2001–2003

The Director of Programs then introduced the 2001–2003 program plan. He described the plan in terms of an overall approach focused on continuity, linkages and architecture. Continuity is derived from the major themes identified in the Shared Agenda for Action that calls for strategic analysis and multi-year programs. Architecture is used to design programs to build on synergies and partnerships for enhancing financial and human capacity and resources. The linkages are both horizontal and vertical, connecting activities within the programs to maximize the interdisciplinary talents within the Secretariat and with the public and private sectors.

Plenary Discussion on the Proposed NACEC Program Plan and Budget for 2001–2003

The Chair asked that the Program Areas be introduced by blocks of two followed by questions and exchange.

a) Environment, Trade and Economy Program Area

Mr. Block introduced this Program Area.

Ana Karina Gonzalez, of the *Centro Mexicano de Derecho Ambiental*, commented that there is a very delicate balance that motivates the connections between environment, economy and trade. While it is important to promote the further development of methodologies to better understand this balance, it is also very important to assess experience in apply the methodology. Further support should be solicited from academics and other organizations. A relationship with the 14 people/groups who presented papers at the Symposium should be maintained.

b) Conservation of Biodiversity Program Area

Jurgen Hoth, NACEC Program Manager on Conservation of Biodiversity Program, introduced this Program Area.

Priscilla Stephan, of the US World Wildlife Fund, asked about the status of the work on strategic directions for the conservation of biodiversity and what the public can expect from this document. Mr. Hoth replied that all feedback received up to 15 August 2000 will be integrated and the

document will be available on NACEC web site by the end of the year. It will form the basis of future work. Mr. Block added that the document would assist in identifying new initiatives. For example, grasslands and the Baja to Bering regions are emerging as key regions.

Andrea Abel, National Wildlife Federation, noted that biodiversity was a very ambitious portfolio and asked what efforts are being made to spin off projects to other organizations. Mr. Block replied that as projects mature, they have the potential for becoming financially self sufficient and used the North American Bird Conservation Strategy as an example. For other projects, such as the Bight of the Californias, exit strategies are being developed. Hans Herrmann, NACEC Head of the Conservation of Biodiversity Program, went on to explain that these exist strategies should also identify conditions that have to be met before 'we move out', and include the preparation of lessons learned.

Ms. Abel continued that as the biodiversity program continues efforts should be made to connect it with other parts of NACEC program, especially trade and environment. Yesterday's Symposium clearly demonstrated the need to make this link.

c) Law and Policy Program Area

Darlene Pearson, NACEC Head of the Law and Policy Program, introduced this Program Area.

Donna Tingley, JPAC member, expressed satisfaction with the progress toward integrating the Law and Policy work with other NACEC programs and noted the importance of assessing, early on, how legal mechanisms can contribute to improved enforcement. She also supported the work on developing comparative reports on environmental standards and suggested that biotechnology/GMOs should be considered as a topic.

Ms. Pearson replied that the areas identified in the program plan for comparative studies (such as hazardous wastes, intensive agriculture), were the result of applying a grid of criteria, including links with past or ongoing NACEC work, relative national priority, , trade-related effects, the level of regulatory controls in existence, etc. The study would help to examine the existence of regulatory trends or gaps in the area reviewed.

d) Pollutants and Health Program Area

Erica Phipps, NACEC Program Manager on Technical Cooperation and Paul Miller, NACEC Program Manager on Air Quality, introduced this Program Area.

Liette Vasseur, JPAC member asked Ms. Phipps what had become of JPAC's Advice to Council to move forward in developing a NARAP for lead. Ms. Phipps did not have current information but undertook to get a reply.

Action: Secretariat

Eric Dannenmaier, of the North-South Center, complimented Ms. Pearson on the clarity and focus of the program and thanked her for reaching out to the public early in her tenure. He suggested that the OAS had done much work and had much to offer toward an inter-American strategy on wildlife enforcement. He went on to note the challenge of describing “effective enforcement”. A methodology needs to be developed and a scholarly review of impacts of enforcement activities could contribute to this. Finally he suggested that regarding lessons learned and Articles 14 and 15, efficacy be applied to the review and analysis of the filings and NACEC’s involvement.

Mateo Castillo, Mexican NAC Coordinator, asked that the guidance document, *Improving Environmental Performance and Compliance: 10 Elements of Effective Environmental Management Systems*, be shared with certification agencies. He also supported Ms. Tingley’s suggestion that GMO’s be a topic for comparative analysis. Finally he urged JPAC to continue pressure for proper implementation of Article 10(6) of the NAAEC.

Paul Kibel, an attorney, suggested that enforcement work should shift from its focus on illegal trophy hunting and trade to the primary cause of wildlife loss and habitat destruction. Work on legal mechanisms should be expanded to enforcement and compliance with laws on wildlife conservation. This work should obviously be connected with the biodiversity program.

Ms. Pearson replied to Mr. Castillo that, yes, the guidance document will be shared. To Mr. Kibel she replied that Canada has not yet passed its species at risk legislation and the limited funding has made it necessary to target wildlife enforcement but that links are being made with the conservation of Biodiversity Program regarding marine protected areas and invasive species.

e) Other Initiatives

Peter Berle, JPAC member noted that JPAC has expressed the need to better understand the issues surrounding Chapter 11 of NAFTA. Ms. Pearson encouraged JPAC to maintain their interest.

Serena Wilson, JPAC member, brought forward the issue of amicus briefs within Chapter 11 of NAFTA. She noted the file of correspondence that has developed around this issue. She recommended that JPAC express its support, in general, for amicus briefs in arbitration proceedings. Furthermore, it is important for Council to take a decision what role Chapter 10(6) of the NAAEC gives it in Chapter 11 of NAFTA.

Plenary Discussion on the Draft JPAC Public Review of Issues Concerning the Implementation and Further Elaboration of Articles 14 and 15

The Chair reviewed events since the last meeting. Following the Council Session and the new responsibilities given to JPAC for Articles 14 and 15 via Council Resolution 00-09, a "Draft JPAC Public Review of Issues Concerning the Implementation of Further Elaboration of Articles 14 and 15" was prepared. She thanked Daniel Basurto, Peter Berle and Donna Tingley, the JPAC Working Group members, for their hard work in preparing and reviewing this draft.

This text was then sent out for public comments on July 31. The draft outlines the steps JPAC proposes to follow in its review of issues referred to it by Council. The deadline to submit comments was September 22. Only 11 comments were received. JPAC then organized, with the assistance of a consultant, a report on the public comments received which was made public.

The Chair explained that JPAC would use the results of this discussion during an in-camera session later in the day and would report in the next day's meeting.

The chair then invited Donna Tingley to make a brief presentation on the review process. Ms. Tingley also explained JPAC's thinking on how they arrived at this draft so that JPAC and the public can develop a common understanding. Two areas in the public comments are of particular importance. Concerning deadlines, she explained that as a group of volunteers it is very difficult for JPAC to "make promises they can't keep". Flexibility and good faith are the approach JPAC prefers. JPAC also debated whether more or less specificity was appropriate. It concluded that this is not a quasi-judicial process and having strict rules of definition and tests for relevancy would lead to wrangling over process and limit JPAC's ability to give independent, reasoned advice.

The following comments were received:

- There should be a glossary of definitions.
- There should be a clear expression of goals.
- There should be provisions for amending the process after an annual performance audit.
- The accompanying diagram is not clear.
- The essential purpose of the process is to ensure that any further conversations regarding the Guidelines are held in public.
- Another purpose is to address shortcomings from the public point of view (i.e., timing and transparency).
- The review process should reflect the input of the Lessons Learned work.
- Deadlines are essential to guarantee utility to submitters.
- Amendments to the Guidelines may ultimately be required.
- Will the Secretariat produce a report to assist the public in the Lessons Learned work?
- Deadlines would give more credibility to the process.
- The term "further elaboration" in the title of Resolution 00-09 suggests the possibility of revisions.
- Minimally, there should be a deadline for Council's responding to JPAC advice.
- Combine the December workshop on Lessons Learned with further opportunity for the public to discuss the review process.
- The Secretariat and Parties should take part in the Lessons Learned work, not just the submitters.
- Do whatever is necessary to reduce the possibility for the Parties or a Party to stall a review.
- There must be adequate budgets given to JPAC to do this work.

- JPAC, through its regular mandate, can provide advice outside the scope of Resolution 00-09. Should not use this Resolution as a means to limit possible advice on matters related to Articles 14 and 15.
- The Resolution terminates Parties' discussions absent JPAC involvement. If Council wants to engage in a discussion, it first has to refer the issue to JPAC. Therefore, there are no more discussions absent public review.
- One should not have to be a lawyer to participate in a public review process.
- It is more difficult to cause mischief in the process if it is kept simple and flexible. Simplicity encourages trust and confidence.
- There is a governance problem. Council's inability to cooperate trickles down to block the process. That is the essential problem.

Update on the first Call for Comments on Submissions History Leading to Lessons Learned

The Chair explained that, through a Call for Public Comments, JPAC also asked for input on the history of the submissions process for the lessons learned report that Council has asked JPAC to prepare. JPAC has created a separate Working Group for this part of its mandate (Cam Avery, Steve Owens, Blanca Torres). She also sent a letter to former and current submitters encouraging them to provide comments on their experiences. She reported that 16 comments were received. Consultants have been engaged to assist in the review and preparation of the report. She explained that during the in-camera session later today, JPAC would discuss how best to proceed and report back during the next day's session.

Carla Sbert, NACEC Legal Officer Submissions on Enforcement Matters Unit, confirmed the Secretariat's participation in this review.

The following comments were made:

- How is it possible to clarify what is and is not a "failure to enforce".
- It is important to publicize the results of a review as widely as possible.
- Interviewing past submitters will be an effective way to identify lessons learned and precedents.
- There should be an extension to the Call for Public Comments. Other submitters should be given time to contribute.
- Consider sending questions out to petitioners to provoke a reply.
- Where is Council's referral memorandum?
- If a Party does not respect delays, what happens? - nothing. This allows the process to go on forever.
- Audit each submission and generate a checklist with concrete questions. This could lead to an action plan.
- The Workshop should also focus on developing proposals for the fall 2001 final report - not just a report on lessons learned. We need solid recommendations.

Saturday, 14 October

Meeting with the Alternate Representatives

Prior to the opening of the day's session, a breakfast meeting was held with the Alternate Representatives. JPAC provided updates on the discussions regarding the public review process for Articles 14 and 15 and the Lessons Learned work. The proposed NACEC Program Plan and Budget for 2001–2003 was discussed. JPAC and the Alternate Representatives also took this opportunity to exchange views on matters related to NAFTA Chapter 11 and 10(6) of the NAAEC.

Administrative Matters

- a) Discussion of a Potential Advice to Council on the North American Symposium on Understanding the Linkages between Trade and Environment

It was decided that it was premature to prepare an Advice to Council. JPAC would study the summary of the Symposium and prepare an informed Advice in due course. In the meantime, a letter will be sent to Council expressing JPAC's view that the Symposium was a great success and that Advice would be forthcoming.

Action: JPAC Chair, JPAC

- b) Discussion of a Potential Advice to Council on the Proposed NACEC Program Plan and Budget for 2001–2003

It was decided that each JPAC Working Group on the Program Plan would conduct a further review and send specific recommendations for an Advice to the JPAC Coordinator in order to provide Advice to Council by December 2000. Various issues, however, preoccupied the JPAC members. These included: genetically modified organisms and where this topic can best fit into the program; the phasing out of projects that are not continental in scope; and where and how in the program Council can best exercise its role, mandated by NAAEC Article 10(6), to monitor the environmental effects of NAFTA.

Action: JPAC Working Groups

- c) Discussion of the JPAC Program 2001–2003

This item was not discussed

Update on Various Issues

- a) Draft JPAC Public Review of Issues Concerning the Implementation and Further Elaboration of Articles 14 and 15

The Chair reported on the results of JPAC's in-camera discussions. It was decided not to finalize the review process at this time. Rather, the JPAC working group would review the input received

at this meeting and circulate a new draft. It was also decided that the review process should be informed by the lessons learned work. JPAC will discuss this matter at its next Regular Session.

In the meantime, it was also decided to forward the letter received from the Friends of the Oldman River to Council.

It was also noted that JPAC had received, that morning, the referral memorandum from the Parties pursuant to paragraph 5(b) of Council Resolution 00-09.

Action: JPAC Working Group on Articles 14 and 15, JPAC Chair, Council

b) Article 10(6) of the NAAEC; NAFTA Chapter 11

It was reported that during the private meeting with the Alternate Representatives, JPAC urged the Parties to support the introduction of amicus briefs into the process as one technique for providing public access. The question was posed to the Alternate Representatives by JPAC: does Council, as environmental representatives, have authority under the NAAEC to monitor the environmental effects of NAFTA and what does Council consider its role to be in Chapter 11 cases? JPAC cautioned that if public participation is not accommodated in the arbitration process, the whole system would collapse.

c) Negotiations Toward a North American Agreement on Transboundary Environmental Impact Assessment

No change was reported.

d) State of the Environment Report

Item was not discussed.

e) Appointments to the JPAC Working Groups

Serena Wilson volunteered to discuss with her US colleagues where she could best replace existing US members and report the decision to the JPAC Liaison Officer who would make the changes. No decision was taken on appointing a Canadian member to the Working Group on Green Transportation Corridors.

Action: US JPAC Members

f) Election of the JPAC Chair for 2001

The Chair explained the election procedure. The Chair for 2001 will be elected from among the Canadian members. The voting will begin on 1 November, by secret ballot and close on 30 November. The results will be announced on 1 December.

g) Next JPAC Regular Session 7–8 December 2000

The next Regular Session will be held in Montreal in conjunction with a public meeting of the Intergovernmental Advisory Group on Emerging Environmental Trends and immediately following the JPAC workshop on Lessons Learned related to Articles 14 and 15.

Action: JPAC

Observers' Comments

Nathalie Chalifour, World Wildlife Fund Canada, agreed that it would be useful for JPAC to review the papers and results from the Symposium before making an Advice to Council for follow up work. However, she suggested that, additionally, NACEC should contract an analysis of the Symposium and recommendations for publication, along with the proceedings. She further suggested that a next step could be to select sectors and establish working groups to take a closer look at indicators, criteria, etc., and then develop policy recommendations. That could be the basis for a future gathering.

Mateo Castillo, Mexican NAC Coordinator, thanked JPAC for its ongoing energy and NACEC for organizing the Symposium that provided a wealth of information for him to share with the Mexican NAC and the Council for Sustainable Development.

Dominga Gonzalez observed that NACEC is starting a new cycle and leaving nationalities at the door of the meetings. The Symposium was an excellent example. She suggested that NACEC develop a stronger, North American identity. BT corn and its threat to the reproductive capacity of the Monarch butterfly could be a unifying issue.

The Chair thanked all the participants, the staff, the interpreters and the members then adjourned the session.

Prepared by Lorraine Brooke

APPROVED BY JPAC MEMBERS ON 23 NOVEMBER 2000



Commission for Environmental Cooperation

**Joint Public Advisory Committee Session 00-03
13–14 October 2000**

Melrose Hotel

2430 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Washington DC 20037
Phone: (202) 955–6400 Fax: (202) 955–5765

Provisional Agenda

Chair: Ms. Regina Barba

Friday, 13 October 2000

- 9:00–9:30 Welcome and Overview by the JPAC Chair
- a) Approval of the Provisional Agenda
 - b) Report from the CEC Executive Director and Question Period
 - c) Report by National and Governmental Advisory Committee Representatives
- 9:30–9:45 Report on the North American Symposium on Understanding the Linkages between Trade and Environment held on 11-12 October by the CEC Head of Environment, Economy and Trade Programs
- 9:45–10:00 Presentation of the Proposed CEC Program Plan and Budget for 2001–2002 by the CEC Director of Program
- 10:00–11:15 Plenary Discussion on the Proposed CEC Program Plan and Budget for 2001–2002
- a) Environment, Trade and Economy Program Area
 - b) Conservation of Biodiversity Program Area
- 11:15–11:30 Break
- 11:30–12:30 Plenary Discussion on the Proposed CEC Program Plan and Budget for 2001-2002 (cont'd)
- c) Pollutants and Health Program Area
 - d) Law and Policy Program Area
 - e) Others initiatives
- 12:30–14:00 Lunch
- 14:00–16:00 Plenary Discussion on the Draft JPAC Public Review of Issues Concerning the Implementation and Further Elaboration of Articles 14 & 15
- 16:00–16:15 Break
- 16:15–16:45 Update on the first Call for Comments on Submissions History Leading to Lessons Learned *
- a) Status Report
 - b) Public Workshop on 7 December 2000
- 16:45–17:00 Observers' Comments

17:00

Adjournment

17:30–18:30 JPAC In-Camera Session on the Draft JPAC Public Review of Issues Concerning the Implementation and Further Elaboration of Articles 14 & 15 and on the Submissions History Leading to Lessons Learned

Saturday, 14 October 2000

- 9:00–11:00 Administrative Matters *
- a) Discussion of the Potential Advice to Council on the North American Symposium on Understanding the Linkages between Trade and Environment
 - b) Discussion on the Potential Advice to Council on the Proposed CEC Program Plan and Budget for 2001-2002
 - c) Discussion on the JPAC Program 2001-2002
- 11:00–11:15 Break
- 11:15–11:45 Update on Various Issues *
- a) Draft JPAC Public Review of Issues Concerning the Implementation and Further Elaboration of Articles 14 & 15
 - b) Article 10(6) of the NAAEC: NAFTA Chapter 11
 - c) Negotiations Toward a North American Agreement on Transboundary Environmental Impact
 - d) State of the Environment Report
 - e) Appointments to JPAC Working Groups
 - f) Election of the JPAC Chair for 2001
 - g) Next JPAC Regular Session of 7-8 December 2000
- 11:45–12:00 Observers' Comments
- 12:00 End of the Session

* Session opened to the public as observers.



**Session du Comité consultatif public mixte (CCPM) n° 00-03
Sesión 00-03 del Comité Consultivo Público Conjunto (CCPC)
Joint Public Advisory Committee Session (JPAC) N° 00-03**

13–14 octobre 2000 / 13 y 14 de octubre de 2000 / 13–14 October 2000

Melrose Hotel

2430 Pennsylvania Avenue NW
Washington, D.C. 20037
Phone: (202) 955–6400 Fax: (202) 955–5765

**Liste des participants
Lista de participantes
List of Participants**

CCPM/CCPC/JPAC

Cam Avery
Director of Public Affairs
B.C. Gas
24th Floor
1111 West Georgia
Vancouver, British Columbia V6E 4M4
Tel: (604) 443-6603
Fax: (604) 443-6614
e-mail: cavery@bcgas.com

Regina Barba
Secretaria General
Unión de Grupos Ambientalistas, I.A.P.
Av. Antonio Rodríguez #57. bis
Col. San Simón, Ticumac
México D.F. 03660
Tel: (011 525) 672-6149 / 532-2717
Fax: (011 525) 532-5639
e-mail: elrasa@df1.telmx.net.mx
Presidenta del CCPC por el 2000

Daniel Basurto
Abogado
Derecho Ambiental
Basurto, Santillana y Arguijo, S.C.
Homero N° 1804, Desp.602
Col. Polanco
México D.F. 11570
Tel: (011 525) 395-1085
Fax: (011 525) 395-1095/1540
e-mail: dbasurto@lexcorp.com.mx

Peter Berle
P.O. Box 881
Stockbridge, Massachusetts 01262
Tel: (413) 298-0061
Fax: (413) 298-0069
e-mail: pberle@audubon.org

Ernesto Enkerlin
Director, Pronatura Noreste
Professor, Tecnológico de Monterrey
Centro de Calidad Ambiental
Garza Sada #2501 Sur
Monterrey, Nuevo León 64849
Tel: (011 528) 328-4032 / 387-5814
Fax: (011 528) 387-5815 / 359-6280
e-mail: eenkerlin@pronatura.org.mx

Steve Owens
Senior Counsel
Muchmore & Wallwork, PC
2700 N. Central Avenue
Suite 1225
Phoenix, Arizona 85004
Tel: (602) 240-6652
Fax: (602) 240-6697
e-mail: sowens@mmww.com

Donna Tingley
Executive Director
Clean Air Strategic Alliance
9940-106th Street, 9th Floor
Edmonton, Alberta T5K 2N2
Tel: (780) 427-9793
Fax: (780) 422-3127
e-mail: dtingley@casahome.org

Blanca Torres

Profesora / Investigadora
Centro de Estudios Internacionales
El Colegio de México, A.C.
Camino al Ajusco 20
Col. Pedregal de Santa Teresa
México D.F. 01900
Tel: (011 525) 449-3000 Ext. 3042
Fax: (011 525) 645-0464
e-mail: btorres@colmex.mx

Liette Vasseur

International Project Director
Department of Biology and
Environmental Studies Program
Saint-Mary's University
923 Robie St.
Halifax, Nova Scotia B3H 3C3
Tel: (902) 496-8234
Fax: (902) 420-5261
e-mail: Liette.Vasseur@stmarys.ca

Serena Wilson

9100 Mill Creek Landing
Great Falls, Virginia 22066
Tel: (703) 759-4642
Fax: (703) 759-7897
e-mail: wilsonserena@juno.com

John Wirth

President
North American Institute
708 Paseo de Peralta
Santa Fe, New Mexico 87501
Tel: (505) 982-3657
Fax: (505) 983-5840
e-mail: jdwirth@leland.stanford.edu

Participantes / Participants

Andrea Abel

NAFTA Program Specialist
National Wildlife Federation
44 East Avenue
Austin, Texas 78701
Tel: (512) 476-9805
Fax: (512) 476-9810
e-mail: abel@nwf.org

U.S. National Advisory Committee Member

Jean Aden

Senior Institutional Specialist/EA Coordinator
World Bank
1818 H Street N.W., Room MC 8-423
Washington, D.C. 20433
Tel: (202) 458-27491

Fax: (202) 522-1666
e-mail: Jaden@worldbank.org

Gustavo Alanís Ortega

Presidente
Centro Mexicano de Derecho Ambiental
(CEMDA) A.C.
Atlixco 138, Col. Condesa
México, D.F. 06140
Tel: (011-525) 286-3323
Fax: (011-525) 211-2593
e-mail: galanis@cemda.org.mx

Washington, DC 20230
Tel: (202) 482-8356
Fax: (202) 482-5865
e-mail: Peter_Bowman@ita.doc.gov

Monica Araya

Director, Sustainable Americas Program
Yale Center for Environmental Law and Policy
301 Prospect St.
New Haven, Connecticut 06511
Tel: (203) 624-7783
Fax: (203) 432.3817
e-mail: monica.araya@yale.edu

Brenda Armstrong

Vice President
Moresby Consulting Ltd
3259 Telescope Terrace
Nanaimo, British Columbia V9T 3V4
Tel: (250) 758-8434
Fax: (250) 758-4075
e-mail: barmstro@mail.island.net
Issues: Forest, Fresh water, Endangered species

David Barkin

Profesor de Economía
Universidad Autónoma Metropolitana
Calzada del Hueso 1100
Villa Quietud, Coyoacán
México, D.F. 04960
Tel: (011-525) 724-5100
Fax: (011 52 5) 724-5235
e-mail: barkin@cueyatl.uam.mx

Ken Boutillier

Assistant Deputy Minister
Aboriginal Relations
Alberta International and Intergovernmental Relations
10155 - 102 Street, 13th floor, Commerce Place
Edmonton, Alberta T5J 4G8
Tel: (780) 422-5925
Fax: (780) 427-4091
e-mail: ken.boutillier@gov.ab.ca

Peter Bowman

International Economist
U.S. Department of Commerce
14th and Constitution Ave, NW

Lorraine Brooke

Consultant
3745 rue St-Jacques West, Suite 220
Montréal, Québec H4C 1H3
Tel: (514) 934-1218
Fax: (514) 937-5114
e-mail: toportia@Mlink.NET

Douglas Jake Caldwell

Program Coordinator for Trade and the Environment

National Wildlife Federation
1400 - 16th Street WW, Suite 501
Washington, DC 20036
Tel: (202) 939-3302
Fax: (202) 797-6646
e-mail: Caldwell@nwf.org

Issues: Conversation, Biodiversity, Articles 14 & 15

Hugo D. Cameron

Associate Editor
International Center for Trade and Sustainable
Development (ICTSD)
13, Chemin des Anémones
Geneva, Switzerland 1219
Tel: (41-22) 917-8336
Fax: (41-22) 917-8093
e-mail: hcameron@ictsd.ch

Nicole Carter

Congressional Research Service
4531, Northaven Rd.
Dallas, Texas 75229
Tel: (214) 357-9805
e-mail: nicolec@stanfordalumni.org

Mateo Castillo

Coordinador de Asuntos Ambientales
Coordinación de Cámaras y Asociaciones
Empresariales del Edo. de Michoacán
Reforma Agraria N° 400-31
"El Pueblito" San José del Cerrito
Morelia Michoacán 58089
México
Tel: (011 524) 320-10-39
Fax: (011 524) 315-7784
e-mail: mateo@mail.giga.com

Coordinador del Comité consultivo nacional (México)

Nathalie Chalifour

Senior Manager Trade, Investment & Policy
World Wildlife Fund Canada
245 Eglinton Avenue East, Suite 410
Toronto, Ontario M4P 3J1
Tel: (416) 489-4567 Ext 232
Fax: (416) 489-3611
e-mail: nchalifour@wwfcanada.org

Issues: Trade & Environment, Forestry, North
American Shared Ecosystems

Dale Colyer

West Virginia University
College of Agriculture and forestry
1164 Agriculture Science building
Morgantown, West Virginia 26506-0002
Tel: (304) 293-4421
Fax: (304) 293-3470
e-mail: dcolyer@wvu.edu

Wilehaldo Cruz

Abogado
Tlacoquemécatl 333-4
Col. Del Valle
México, D.F. 03100
Tel: (011 525) 559-9828
e-mail: willi@avantel.net

R.D. Cunningham

Contributing Editor
The Environmental Network Newsletter
Metropolitan Washington Environmental
Professionals (MWEP)
808 Janneys Lane
Alexandria, VA 22302
Tel: (703) 548-6786
Fax: (703) 548-6786
e-mail: cunninggr@erols.com

Eric R. Dannenmaier

Director
Environmental Law Program
North-South Center
1420, 16th St, Suite 401
Washington, DC 20036 USA
Tel: (202) 986-4264
Fax: (202) 986-7250
e-mail: edmsn@msn.com

Jean-François Dionne

Advisor
Americas Branch
Environment Canada
10 Wellington, 25th Floor
Hull, Québec K1A 0H3
Tel: (819) 994-6051
Fax: (819) 997-0199
e-mail: JeanFrancois.Dionne@ec.gc.ca

Pamela Doughman

Research Assistant
University of Maryland
3140 Tydings Hall

College Park, MD 20742
Tel: (301) 405 4125
e-mail: pdoughma@gvpt.umd.edu

Ira R. Feldman

President
Greentrack strategies
114 North Van Buren Street
Rockville, Maryland 20850
Tel.: (301) 294-1686
Fax: (301) 294-1687
e-mail: bigeye@erols.com

Denise Ferguson-Southard

Director
Air and Waste Management
Delaware Department of Natural Resources
and Environmental Control
89 Kings Highway
Dover, Delaware 19901
Tel: (302) 739-4764
Fax: (302) 739-5060
e-mail: dferguson-s@state.de.us
U.S. Governmental Advisory Committee Chair

Claudia Fernández Velasco

Coordinadora del Comité Directivo nacional
Convergencia por la Democracia
Louisiana #113, PB
México, D.F. 04310
Tel: (011-525) 543-8537
Fax: (011-525) 543-8541
e-mail: Fernancezclaudia@AOL.com

Emily Goldman

Program Manager, Latin America & Caribbean
Counterpart International
1200 – 18th St., NW, Suite 1100
Washington, DC 20036
Tel: (202) 296-9676
Fax: (202) 296-9679
e-mail: egoldman@counterpart.org
Issues: Future funding for projects in Mexico

Ana Karina González

Programa sobre comercio y medio ambiente
Centro Mexicano de Derecho Ambiental A.C.
Atlixco No. 138, Col. Condesa
México, D.F. 06140
Tel: (011 525) 211-2457 Ext. 17
Fax: (011 525) 211-2593
e-mail: akgl@cemda.org.mx

Joseph Greewald

Attorney/Consultant
Consultants International Group
1616 H Street N.W. Suite 400
Washington, DC 20006
Tel.: (202) 659-4242
Fax: (202) 393-4655

Ruth Greey

ECR Program Manager
CEA
147 Yonge Blvd.
Toronto, Ontario M5M 3H3
Tel: (416) 489-3420
Fax: (416) 489-7547
e-mail: greedy@canelect.ca

Mimi Guernica

Deputy Office Director
U.S. EPA/OECA/OPPA
1200 Pennsylvania Ave., N.W.
Washington, D.C. 20004
Tel: (202) 564-7048
Fax: (202) 564-0017
e-mail: Guernica.mimi@epa.gov

Robert Heine

Director, International Trade and Investment
Dupont Company
601 Pennsylvania Ave, NW, Suite 325
North Building
Washington, DC 20004
Tel: (202) 728-3618
Fax: (202) 728-3649
e-mail: robert.M.Heine@USA.Dupont.com

Sheila Holbrook-White

Texas Citizen Fund
107 W. Eighth
Austin, Texas 78701
Tel: (512) 699 8136
Fax: 512 451 3667
e-mail: ScoutTxCA@aol.com

Erik Jansson

Executive Director
Department of the Planet Earth
701 E Street, SE, Suite 200
Washington, DC 20003
Tel: (202) 543-5450
Fax: (202) 543-4791
e-mail: planetearth@erols.com

Paul L. Joffe

Associate Director for Advocacy
National Wildlife Federation
1400 16th Street, NW, Suite 501
Washington, D.C. 20036
Tel.: (202) 797-6603
Fax: (202) 797-5486
e-mail: joffe@nwf.org

Mark Juhasz

Faculty of Environmental Studies
York University
309 Deloraine Ave
Toronto, Ontario M5M 2B4
Tel: (416) 782-6279
Fax: (416) 782-9759
e-mail: markjuhasz@hotmail.com

Stephen Kass

Attorney
Carter, Ledyard & Milburn
2 Wall Street
New York, New York 10005
Tel: (212) 238-8801
Fax: (212) 732-3232
e-mail: kass@clm.com

Paul S. Kibel

Attorney
Fitzgerald, Abbott & Beardsley
1221 Broadway, 21st Floor
Oakland, California 94612
Tel. (510) 451-3300
Fax (510) 451-1527
e-mail: PKibel@fablaw.com

John Knox

Assistant Professor
Dickinson School of Law
150 S. College Street
Pennsylvania State University
Carlisle, Pennsylvania 17013
Tel: (717) 240-5000
Fax: (717) 240-5126
e-mail: jhk5@psu.edu

Elaine Koerner

Designated Federal Officer
U.S. Environmental Protection Agency
Ariel Rios Building, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue,
N.W.
Washington, DC 20004
Tel: (202) 564 1484
e-mail: Koerner.elaine@epa.gov

Gerardo Arturo Limón Dominguez

Presidente
Estatel del Movimiento Ecologista
Estado de Chihuahua
Cortéz de Monroy 3102
Parques de San Felipe
Chihuahua, Chihuahua 31240
Tel: (521) 414-4552
Fax: (521) 414-4552
e-mail: Galimon@prodigy.Net.mx

Jose Lopez

Mexican News Agency
425 National Press Bldg
Washington, DC 20045
Tel: (202) 347-5227

Catherine Malinin Dunn

Attorney-Advisor
US EPA/ Office of Enforcement & Compliance
Assurance
Ariel Rico Bldg, 1200 Pennsylvania Ave. N.W.
#2201 A
Washington, DC 20004
Tel.: (202) 564-2629
Fax: (202) 501-0363
e-mail: dunn.catherine@epa.gov

William H. Mansfield III

Consultant
International Environmental Consultant
5633 Lambeth Road
Bethesda, Maryland 20814-1104
Tel: (301) 657-4110
Fax: (301) 907-3915
e-mail: whmansfld@aol.com

William McLeese

Environmental Affairs Officer
Office of Mexican Affairs
U.S. Department of State
2201 C Street, NW - Room 4258
Washington, DC 20520
Tel.: (202) 647-9364
Fax: (202) 647-5752

David Markell

Professor
Albany Law School
80 New Scotland Avenue
Albany, New York 12208
Tel: (518) 472-5861
Fax: (518) 445-2315
e-mail: dmark@ccemtl.org

Edmund Miller

Environment Program Officer
C. S. Mott Foundation
503 S. Saginaw St., Suite 1200
Flint, Michigan 48502
Tel: (810) 238-5651
Fax: (810) 237-4857
e-mail: emiller@mott.org

Carroll Muffett

Defenders of Wildlife
1101, 14th Street N.W., Suite 1400
Washington, DC 20005-5605
Tel: (202) 682-9400 ext.293
Fax: (202) 682-1331
e-mail: cmuffett@defenders.org

Paul Osborne

Assistant Deputy Minister, Trade and International
Relations
Department of Intergovernmental and Aboriginal
Affairs
Government of Saskatchewan
11th Floor, 1919 Saskatchewan Drive
Regina, Saskatchewan S4P 3V7
Tel.: (306) 787-6322
Fax: (306) 787-7317
e-mail: posborne@iaa.gov.sk.ca

Anne Perrault

Center for International Environmental Law (CIEL)
1367 Connecticut Avenue, Suite 300
Washington, DC 20036-1860
Tel: (202) 785-8700
Fax: (202) 785-8701
e-mail: aperrault@ciel.org

Jack Person

Johns Hopkins University
2450 Virginia Ave. NW, Apt. E634
Washington, DC 20037
Tel. (202) 822-1832
e-mail: jperson@gsbpop.uchicago.edu

Kenneth A. Reinert

Associate Professor of Public Policy
School of Public Policy
George Mason University
3401 North Fairfax Drive
Room MS 3B1
Arlington, Virginia 22201
Tel: (703) 993-8212
Fax: (703) 993-8215
e-mail: kreinert@gmu.edu

Robin L. Rosenberg

Deputy Director
Dante B. Fascell North-South Center
University of Miami
1500 Monza Ave, Coral Gables, FL 33146
Tel. 305-284-8957
Fax: 305-284-6370
e-mail: RRosenberg@miami.edu

U.S. National Advisory Committee Member

Maria Sanchez-Carlo

Foreign Service Office
U.S. State Department
221 C Street, NW
Washington, DC 20520
Tel: (202) 647-4750

David Schorr

Director of Sustainable Commerce Program
World Wildlife Fund-US
24th Street - 1250, N.W.
Washington, DC 20037-1175
Tel: (202) 778-9662
Fax: (202) 778-9721
e-mail: david.schorr@wwfus.org

Priscilla Stephan

Program Officer
World Wildlife Fund-US
1250, 24th Street N.W.
Washington, DC 20037-1175
Tel: (202) 778-9668
Fax: (202) 778-9721
e-mail: priscilla.stephan@wwfus.org

Nicole Stoduto

Legal Associate
Defenders of Wildlife
1101 14th Street, NW, Suite 1400
Washington, DC 20005
Tel: (202) 682-9400 Ext: 122
Fax: (202) 682-1331
e-mail: nstoduto@defenders.org

Alicia Torres

Universidad Metropolitana, Azcapotzalco
Iztaccihuatl 41-301 Col. Roma
México, D.F.
Tel.: 5-84-58-17

Michael J. Vechsler

Legal Advisor
International Joint Commission
234 Laurier Avenue West, 22nd Floor
Ottawa, Ontario K1P 6K6
Tel: (613) 995 0259
Fax: (613) 9935583
e-mail: vechlerm@ottawa.ijc.org

Bill Warriner

Intergovernmental Officer
Department of Intergovernmental and Aboriginal
Affairs

Government of Saskatchewan
11th Floor, 1919 Saskatchewan Drive
Regina, Saskatchewan S4P 3V7
Tel.: (306) 787-6264
Fax: (306) 787-7317
e-mail: bwarriner@iaa.gov.sk.ca

Albert Zapanta
President
US-Mexico Chamber of Commerce
1300 Pennsylvania Ave (NW), Suite 270
Washington, DC 20004
Tel.: (202) 371-8680
Fax: (202) 371-8686
e-mail: zapanta@usms.oc.org

CEC / CCA / CCE

Greg Block
Director of Programs
Tel: (514) 350-4320
Fax: (514) 350-4314
e-mail: gblock@ccemtl.org

Chantal-Line Carpentier
Program Manager, Environment, Economy and
Trade Program
Tel: (514) 350-4336
Fax: (514) 350-4314
e-mail: carpentier@ccemtl.org

Janine Ferretti
Executive Director
Tel: (514) 350-4303
Fax: (514) 350-4314
e-mail: ndaoust@ccemtl.org

Hans Herrmann
Head of Conservation of Biodiversity Program
Tel: (514) 350-4340
Fax: (514) 350-4314
e-mail: hherrman@ccemtl.org

Jurgen Hoth
Program Manager, Conservation of Biodiversity
Program
Tel: (514) 350-4307
Fax: (514) 350-4314
e-mail: jhoth@ccemtl.org

Hernando Guerrero
Director of Mexico Liaison Office
Tel: 011 (525) 659-5021
Fax: 011 (525) 659-5023
e-mail: guerrero@cec.org

Paul Miller
Program Manager, Air Quality
Tel: (514) 350-4326
Fax: (514) 350-4314
e-mail: pmiller@ccemtl.org

Jocelyne Morin
JPAC Liaison Assistant

Tel: (514) 350-4366
Fax: (514) 350-4314
e-mail: jmorin@ccemtl.org

Darlene Pearson
Head of Law and Policy Program
Tel: (514) 350-4334
Fax: (514) 350-4314
e-mail: dpearson@ccemtl.org

Manon Pepin
JPAC Liaison Officer
Tel: (514) 350-4305
Fax: (514) 350-4314
e-mail: mpepin@ccemtl.org

Erica Phipps
Program Manager, Technical Cooperation
Tel: (514) 350-4323
Fax: (514) 350-4314
e-mail: ephills@ccemtl.org

Carla Sbert
Legal Officer Submissions on Enforcement Matters Unit
Tel: (514) 350-4321
Fax: (514) 350-4314
e-mail: csbert@ccemtl.org